

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16606

Title: Apoptosis of human pancreatic carcinoma PANC-1 cells induced by Yin Chen Hao Decoction

Reviewer's code: 01557283

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-01-25 15:27

Date reviewed: 2015-02-02 10:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Reviewer's comments As the authors reported, Yin Chen Hao Decoction (YCHD), a classic Chinese medical, seems an interesting potent cancer chemo-preventive agent. The present study expressed experimental data using a single pancreatic cancer cell line (PACN-1) derived from pancreatic ductal adenocarcinoma. The results presented clearly supported their conclusion that the YCHD prevented cell growth of the PANC-1 induced by the down-regulation of the Bcl-2 gene and the up-regulation of the bax gene. However, the data presented might not seem enough to conclude the YCHD is an attractive chemo-preventive agent. Major comments 1. Result: Apoptosis index, Bcl-2 expression, Bax positivity rate, and the density of bcl-2 mRNA and bax mRNA. These data may need time dependent control values, as expressed bellow: The authors may have to fulfill the blanks as shown below. Table 2 Apoptotic index (AI) of pancreatic carcinoma PANC-1 cells treated with TCHD

Time	Zero	24 h	48 h	72 h	96 h	AI (%)
t	-6.12	-13.92	-183.17	-53.90		
P		P<0.05	P<0.05	P<0.05	P<0.05	P<0.05

vs control group; AI: Apoptotic index Table 3 Positivity rate (PR) of Bcl-2 in pancreatic carcinoma PANC-1 cells treated



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

with TCHD Time Zero 24 h 48 h 72 h 96 h PR(%) 36.62±0.69 21.71±0.07 10.60±0.49 7.21±0.45
4.54±0.36 Control t 31.29 44.51 73.62 59.24 P P<0.01 P<0.01 P<0.01 P<0.01 Table 4
Positivity rate (PR) of Bax in pancreatic carcinoma PANC-1 cells treated with TCHD Time Zero 24
h 48 h 72 h 96 h PR(%) 10.29±0.51 20.14±0.79 34.6±0.86 45.24±0.48 58.76±1.47 Control t -56.89
-41.68 -69.95 -51.89 P P<0.001 P<0.001 P<0.001 P<0.001 2. The authors' results may suggest the
efficacy of the YCHD. Data adding another pancreatic ductal carcinoma cell line may support more
their conclusion. The data based on one cell line may not seem to support their conclusion. Minor
comments 1. Page 2. Spell error: diferent 2. Page 2. Spell error: choiestasis 3. Page 2. Suspicion of
spell error: cholanesis?