BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 16990
Title: A newly designed detachable "pieced" stent for the treatment of benign esophageal strictures: results in an animal model
Reviewer's code: 02664735
Reviewer's country: United Kingdom
Science editor: Jing Yu
Date sent for review: 2015-02-06 18:48
Date reviewed: 2015-02-12 03:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[Y] Plagiarism	
		[ ] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This experimental protocol investigated a newly designed stent for benign esophageal strictures in a rabbit esophageal stricture model. Abstract 1. "The stent was removed after 4 weeks" This information is repeated below. 2. The flow of the abstract would improve if the authors described first the development of the stricture model and then stent placement. 3. Please revise the conclusive paragraph to something like: "In this experimental protocol of benign esophageal strictures the novel "pieced" stent demonstrated superior removal rate with similar migration rate compared to a conventional stent", or similar Introduction 1. Please also comment on biodegradable stents either in the introduction or in the discussion section. (Saito Y, et al. Usefulness of biodegradable stents constructed of poly-l-lactic acid monofilaments in patients with benign esophageal stenosis. 2007. World J Gastroenterol. Stivaros SM, et al. Woven polydioxanone biodegradable stents: a new treatment option for benign and malignant oesophageal strictures. 2010 Eur Radiol. Materials and Methods 1. As the authors state that they investigated safety as well as removal, it is necessary to define a clear safety outcome (eg. Stent-related complications during insertion/removal) and

compare it between the two groups. 2. Although the authors report that the stents investigated were fully covered, this is not evident in the images provided. 3. Please report the success rate of stricture development in your model and describe in detail how many animals were needed as to finally include 30 animals. Results 1. Please see previous comment and report results accordingly. 2. Also report that all stents were patent at the end of follow up period Discussion 1. The Niti-S double-layered Covered Nitinol Stent has also demonstrated excellent results with very low migration rates. Please comment. 2. Is it possible to manufacture such stents for human use? Do the authors plan to further investigate this stent in clinical trials? 3. A limitations paragraph is required. Tables Add safety outcome or complications in the table Figures 1. See previous comment on covered stents. 2. Explain the numbers in fig 3 References ok