



ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10924

Title: Gastrotracheal fistula: treatment with a covered self-expanding Y-shaped metallic stent

Reviewer code: 00608177

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-27 14:59

Date reviewed: 2014-05-06 16:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this article the authors describe the case of a 67-year-old man, with a gastro-tracheal fistula after an esophagectomy with gastric pull-up, which was conservatively treated by the broncoscopic placement of a covered self-expanding Y stent. The article may be valuable for publication with the following points that should be addressed prior to final consideration: 1) Why the authors preferred a covered self-expanding stent? In the discussion section, they should briefly explain the advantages of the use of covered self-expanding stents over that of silicon stents in the treatment of this type of lesions. 2) To reduce the risk of secretion retention, it could have been possible to use a covered self-expanding Y stent with shorter bronchial arms? 3) The indication for the placement of the stent was the onset of cough with pulmonary infection. The authors should report in the "Case presentation" section if these symptoms improved after the stent placement. 4) The placement of this type of stents may be made under sedation. The authors should explain in the discussion section why they performed the procedure in general anaesthesia with jet ventilation. 5) The placement of this type of stents may be facilitated by the use of a rigid bronchoscope. The use of a rigid bronchoscope, moreover, may be necessary in case of stent removal. Was a rigid bronchoscope available in the operating room? 6) I don't understand the meaning of the sentence "After consultation with specialists" (Discussion section, page 4, lines 15 and 16). 7) The English requires revision.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10924

Title: Gastrotracheal fistula: treatment with a covered self-expanding Y-shaped metallic stent

Reviewer code: 02445522

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-27 14:59

Date reviewed: 2014-05-08 01:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The work is a case report; necessary to assess the real effectiveness of the stent with a larger number of patients



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10924

Title: Gastrotracheal fistula: treatment with a covered self-expanding Y-shaped metallic stent

Reviewer code: 02445426

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-27 14:59

Date reviewed: 2014-05-12 19:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Wang F et al reported a case of gastrotracheal fistula (GTF) successfully treated with a covered self-expanding Y-shaped metallic stent. The present report is well organized, concise and includes useful information regarding treatment option for this difficult situation. There are minor comments to be revised. 1) As the authors described, GTF occurring in the late post-operative period is most often due to tumor recurrence, radiation necrosis, and tracheobronchial erosion along the gastric staple-line. What was the exact cause of GTF in the present case? 2) As the authors discuss, migration of the stent is among major complications of the straight stent for patients with GTF. Please describe reported incidence (%) of migration of the placed straight stent in the literatures.