

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12954

Title: The use of mesenchymal stem cells to treat liver fibrosis: current situation and future prospects

Reviewer code: 02861102

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-07-31 12:21

Date reviewed: 2014-08-11 17:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this work Berardis et al. evaluate the role of the Mesenchymal stem cells for treatment of liver fibrosis. Overall this is an interesting work with novel and valuable information on the therapy of liver fibrogenesis. The manuscript is well-designed. Nevertheless, I have some minor issues that if addressed by the authors could improve the quality of this report: 1. I would evaluate more the role of HSC and especially their transformation from quiescent to active form. Also, please, highlight the role of α -SMA. 2. On the paragraph about cellular sources of fibrogenesis I would recommend to write more about hepatocytes. 3. The paragraph about histology of the liver fibrosis is somehow confusing and should be rewritten

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12954

Title: The use of mesenchymal stem cells to treat liver fibrosis: current situation and future prospects

Reviewer code: 02446054

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-07-31 12:21

Date reviewed: 2014-08-12 06:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is in general a well written extensive review of liver fibrosis and potential therapies. Besides some minor grammatical errors, the following is suggested: 1. note that these studies are primarily allogeneic ESc, iPCS and MSC cell transplantation. Where autologous, it should be stated 2. It is not clear that tissue based MSCs are advantageous over BM MSCs 3. In vivo MSC differentiation to hepatocytes has been demonstrated in sheep 4. The MELD score needs to be defined

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12954

Title: The use of mesenchymal stem cells to treat liver fibrosis: current situation and future prospects

Reviewer code: 00664488

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-07-31 12:21

Date reviewed: 2014-08-09 20:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an excellent review paper on using mesenchymal stem cells to treat liver fibrosis. It nicely covers many of the recent developments in the field. The paper was well written, except that there were a few minor errors to be corrected. Thus this reviewer would suggest to have this paper published after minor corrections.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12954

Title: The use of mesenchymal stem cells to treat liver fibrosis: current situation and future prospects

Reviewer code: 02942902

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-07-31 12:21

Date reviewed: 2014-08-07 19:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well-written manuscript by Silvia et al. who nicely reviewed on the treatment of liver fibrosis. The review would provide insights to the field of liver fibrosis. I only have few comments for the authors. Comments: 1) Although liver fibrosis has been considered as a progressive and irreversible change, liver fibrosis due to HBV and/or HCV can be improved with the current antiviral treatments. I think they should briefly describe the recent changes in the clinical course of the hepatitis virus-associated liver fibrosis. 2) Some typographical errors should be corrected.