

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12897

Title: Gastroesophageal reflux disease and non-esophageal cancer

Reviewer code: 02917278

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-07-29 14:05

Date reviewed: 2014-08-04 21:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The idea is good but you need more contents in details.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12897

Title: Gastroesophageal reflux disease and non-esophageal cancer

Reviewer code: 00050424

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-07-29 14:05

Date reviewed: 2014-08-05 02:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review, the authors try to discuss existing data on the possible association between gastroesophageal reflux disease and extra esophageal cancers. They quote possible pathophysiological mechanisms and epidemiological studies and they conclude "that laryngeal and pharyngeal tumors are highly associated to GERD. Oral and lung cancers probably also connected to GERD". Someone can assume, based on pathophysiological and epidemiological data, that there is a probable association but not clear evidence. As the authors emphasize "the majority of papers are far from ideal to prove a relationship of extra esophageal cancers and gastroesophageal reflux disease". It should be mentioned that not all studies show a relationship and that even in studies showing positive association this is not too strong. Also it should be emphasized that it is very difficult to have convincing evidence with these studies as many factors such as smoking, alcohol consumption, diet, obesity etc may play a role. Moreover proportional increase in the incidences of two separate diseases do not necessarily indicate etiological relationship. On the other hand, true diagnosis of GERD is questionable as only clinical data were used in previous studies. I think that this review should be written in a more critical way with the title of the article in questioned form. The authors should discuss existing evidence but also analyze weaknesses and problems in interpreting data from the studies on this topic that have been published so far.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12897

Title: Gastroesophageal reflux disease and non-esophageal cancer

Reviewer code: 02824384

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-07-29 14:05

Date reviewed: 2014-08-12 22:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The topic is interesting, however strong conclusions cannot be drawn due to lack of published studies. Current conclusions of the article are not based on sufficient background of good quality data.