

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11753

Title: Genetic association of Apolipoprotein E polymorphisms with inflammatory bowel disease

Reviewer code: 00045410

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-06-03 19:14

Date reviewed: 2014-06-10 16:11

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | | BPG Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A nice study documenting an association between APoE polymorphisms and IBD from Saudi Arabia. It confirms preliminary data from China that APoE polymorphisms constitute a greater risk for IBD albeit a small one. The authors should suggest the overall relative risk of development of IBD with one or more polymorphism(s) of APoE genes. Their data suggests similar association between APoE polymorphisms and ulcerative colitis as well as Crohn's disease except for frequency of allele ε3/ε4 was significantly higher in UC patients but not in CD patients. How do the authors explain this observation. Do the authors have data on other autoimmune diseases in their IBD patients? The Apoe polymorphisms have been documented with a host of illnesses including autoimmune diseases and such varied illnesses as Alzheimer's disease and psychiatric illnesses. The authors could elaborate a bit more on the possible role of APoE polymorphisms in IBD. The authors mention that Crohn's disease was classified as per Montreal classification but they did not describe their results as per phenotypes of this classification. Similarly a comment on association of APoE polymorphisms with disease severity and treatment response could be given. I think there are far too many references which could be shortened. There are a few mistakes in some references eg ref 40. Some of the tables could be better represented as bar diagrams.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11753

Title: Genetic association of Apolipoprotein E polymorphisms with inflammatory bowel disease

Reviewer code: 00043819

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-06-03 19:14

Date reviewed: 2014-06-21 21:06

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this article the Authors studied the association between APoE polimorphism and IBD in a Saudi Arabia population. The paper is well-written, and I think interesting for the Readers of WJG.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11753

Title: Genetic association of Apolipoprotein E polymorphisms with inflammatory bowel disease

Reviewer code: 00044333

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-06-03 19:14

Date reviewed: 2014-06-24 11:25

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors presented genetic association of APOE polymorphisms with UC and CD. Although the case number is small, they described the results well and showed some new findings like association with CD. If the authors could add some additional results, like association with clinical phenotype, severity and prognosis, it would be helpful to improve the quality of manuscript.