

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11843

Title: In a Thai population a Defective DNA Mismatch Repair is associated with favorable prognosis in Sporadic Colorectal Cancer

Reviewer code: 02451547

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-06-08 20:03

Date reviewed: 2014-06-19 09:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The authors should present original pictures of IHC to show the positive and negative results of MMR expression. 2. The authors stated that dMMR was associated with favorable DFS and OS in their study cohort, however, adjuvant chemotherapy may be a factor for OS. How do the authors regard the role of adjuvant chemotherapy in DFS and OS. 3. Just as the authors mentioned that "Of the 211 patients, IHC for MMR proteins and MSI detection was analyzed in 164 and 47 tumors, respectively. dMMR was identified in 10 out of 164 tumors and 21 out of 44 tumors; therefore the total of dMMR was 31 out of 208 tumors (14.9%)." The detection rate of dMMR was higher in MSI detection than IHC for MMR proteins. Why the authors did not use one method to detect dMMR in this study.