

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12642

Title: Albumin and MRI-liver lobe volume to identify cirrhotic severity and esophageal varices

Reviewer code: 02861170

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-07-20 09:49

Date reviewed: 2014-07-31 14:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Authors, I have read with great interest Your manuscript entitled "Albumin and MRI-liver lobe volume to identify cirrhotic severity and esophageal varices". The paper makes original contribution and it is clinically exhaustive. The manuscript is well written, seems accurate and well organized. Author Guidelines has been followed properly in preparing the manuscript. Literature review is adequate.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12642

Title: Albumin and MRI-liver lobe volume to identify cirrhotic severity and esophageal varices

Reviewer code: 02861019

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-07-20 09:49

Date reviewed: 2014-08-19 01:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Authors, I have read with great interest the manuscript enclosed. You observed the interesting correlation between radiologic and biochemical parameters for the prediction of "presence of cirrhosis", "Child-pugh stage of the disease" and "presence of EV". The sample size is too little and patients are too inhomogeneous to draw strong conclusions. In particular: - diagnosis of liver cirrhosis (comparison among healthy volunteers vs. all other patients): healthy control group is too small while cirrhotic group includes both compensated and decompensated patients; - for the non invasive diagnosis of esophageal varices, there are some criticism: a big amount of patients presented with clinical decompensation (ascites) while had no sign of EV on upper endoscopy; moreover, while there is a significant clinical relevance for the diagnosis of PH and EV among compensated patients, this relevance is weak if we include also decompensated pts; - which is the clinical relevance of the correlation of the child-pugh stage with a radiologic parameter? Despite these criticisms I appreciate this study, so I suggest to include more patients with compensated cirrhosis for the correlation between the proposed score with the presence of EV; include more compensated patients to have a distribution of the disease mimicking the clinical presentation of our patients; avoid the comparison with healthy volunteers.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12642

Title: Albumin and MRI-liver lobe volume to identify cirrhotic severity and esophageal varices

Reviewer code: 02860874

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-07-20 09:49

Date reviewed: 2014-08-19 01:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations to the authors, this a very well conducted study, with interesting findings. I only make minor corrections: Page 8, paragraph 2, line 18: Authors wrote: "age range, 31-76 years; mean age, 56 years" Comment: if you report age range you must report median age, on the other hand, if you report mean age, then you must report its standard deviation. References 23 and 24: Please, fist author in black, and also in black the volume number. Please note that you must provide PMID and DOI where applicable: English journal article (list all authors and include the PMID where applicable) For example: 1 Jung EM Jung EM, Clevert DA, Schreyer AG, Schmitt S, Rennert J, Kubale R, Feuerbach S, Jung F. Evaluation of quantitative contrast harmonic imaging to assess malignancy of liver tumors: A prospective controlled two-center study. World J Gastroenterol 2007; 13: 6356-6364 [PMID: 18081224 DOI: 10.3748/wjg.13.6356]

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12642

Title: Albumin and MRI-liver lobe volume to identify cirrhotic severity and esophageal varices

Reviewer code: 02860966

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-07-20 09:49

Date reviewed: 2014-08-26 23:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for the opportunity to review this manuscript. My major comment is that the implicit proposal for why MRI should be used (or considered for use) in this setting should be significantly strengthened. It is not obvious why this approach may be better or how it may satisfy an unmet clinical need.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12642

Title: Albumin and MRI-liver lobe volume to identify cirrhotic severity and esophageal varices

Reviewer code: 02861055

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-07-20 09:49

Date reviewed: 2014-08-27 18:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Hang Li et al. submitted the manuscript entitled "Albumin and MRI-liver lobe volume to identify cirrhotic severity and esophageal varices" for peer review. The Authors study the potential of a combination of hepatic lobe volumes (measured by MRI) and albumin levels in the identification of liver cirrhosis severity and esophageal varices in patients affected by HBV. A number of remarks are listed below:

- The Authors only included patients affected by hepatitis B in their study. This aspect should be emphasized in the title of the manuscript.
- In order to make the message of the paper more direct, the Authors should add a conclusive table with the best parameter they identified for each category (e.g. presence/absence of cirrhosis, Child-Pugh class A/Child-Pugh class B, etc.) and the relative sensitivity and specificity.
- The results presented in Table 3 for RV, RV/ALB and CV/ALB are in contradiction with what stated in the results. The Authors should carefully check the pertinence of the data inserted in the tables.
- In the Introduction, the Authors state that "In early stage of cirrhosis, the liver is still compensating and interferon treatment can help prolong sufficient liver function". Interferon treatment is reserved to very specific liver diseases. The sentence is therefore inappropriate. The Authors should reformulate this sentence.
- The data about the albumin values of the patients could be added to Table 2.
- In Materials and Methods, the Authors should include a bibliographic citation to the Goldsmith and Woodburne system used to define the liver lobes.
- The paper should be revised for grammatical errors, omissions and punctuation.