

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16097

Title: Female SDT fatty rats develop Non-Alcoholic Steatohepatitis (NASH)-like hepatic lesions

Reviewer's code: 00503536

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-26 15:21

Date reviewed: 2015-04-22 20:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript written by Ishii Y. et al. reports a possible new NASH model of mice. They examined the characteristics of female SDT fatty mice, and found that the mice could become a new model of human NASH. The mice model actually show similar characteristics of NASH including liver histology and gene expression in the liver. However, there are some concerns that need to be addressed. Major point, 1. The mice show hyperglycemia, but it is caused by hypoinsulinemia as the authors stated. In human NASH, insulin resistance is an important metabolic abnormality, and the serum insulin levels are higher than those in normal controls. The authors should show the kinetics of serum insulin levels, and discuss on the point. Minor points, 1. Did the mice show liver tumor (preneoplastic or neoplastic)? 2. In the Discussion, the authors should make summarized comments on the similarities and differences of the model as compared with human NASH.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16097

Title: Female SDT fatty rats develop Non-Alcoholic Steatohepatitis (NASH)-like hepatic lesions

Reviewer's code: 02939706

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-26 15:21

Date reviewed: 2015-04-19 03:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Author(s), Although it seems to me a qualified article there are several spelling, punctuation and grammar errors in the whole text. Therefore, the manuscript should be rechecked and afterwards must be resubmitted before a detailed review. Regards,

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16097

Title: Female SDT fatty rats develop Non-Alcoholic Steatohepatitis (NASH)-like hepatic lesions

Reviewer's code: 02822528

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-26 15:21

Date reviewed: 2015-04-29 09:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the authors investigated the histological features of the liver in SDT fatty rats without manipulating diet. This article is new and interesting. However, there is one major concern remain. The authors compared the histological features of liver sections between SDT fatty rats and age-matched SD rats, and they examined the expression of genes in liver involved in TG synthesis, inflammation and fibrosis as well. However, the authors have better use SDT rats rather than SD rats as control. The authors should explain why they use SD rats as control.