

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16342

Title: Comparison of effects of obesity and non-alcoholic fatty liver disease on incidence of type 2 diabetes mellitus

Reviewer's code: 00003472

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-01-13 18:35

Date reviewed: 2015-04-11 16:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Li et al. have investigated the association between NAFLD and T2DM in Chinese. I have a few comments. 1) Does this study include the patients with other liver diseases or gastrointestinal disease? The authors should show the information on the number of HBV-, HCV-infection, inflammatory bowel disease, and Celiac disease. 2) There are several reports that demonstrate NAFLD is a predicting factor for T2DM. The author should show merits of the present study compared with other studies. Readers may have interested in the difference between China and other countries. 3) There are several errors in the text and the tables.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16342

Title: Comparison of effects of obesity and non-alcoholic fatty liver disease on incidence of type 2 diabetes mellitus

Reviewer's code: 00007116

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-01-13 18:35

Date reviewed: 2015-04-20 09:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The association between NAFLD and type 2 DM has already been reported in another oriental population. Though this finding is not novel, this study has its value in confirming this finding in other oriental populations. However, there were several points to be answered. 1. The Introduction is very long and there are considerable unnecessary contents in there. I would recommend condensing the Introduction. 2. The definition of NAFLD was not sufficiently mentioned in this study. It would be better if the authors add the sentence for detailed definition of NAFLD in the method section 3. There are quite articles about the association between NAFLD and diabetes. Does this paper have novel and interesting findings which are different from previous studies? 4. The detailed information of "Chinese Adult Overweight and Obesity Prevention and Control Guidelines" which mentioned in discussion section should be listed in reference section. 5. The authors did not provide the prevalence of other risk factors for diabetes in the patients with NAFLD. It would be more interesting to state about that. 6. There was no information about history of alcohol consumption. Were the alcoholics excluded in this study? 7. The authors strongly emphasize their



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

finding that risk of diabetes in NAFLD subjects is significantly higher than that in overweight and obese subjects. The fact that the conclusions were not based on a randomized comparison, the authors should really be much more careful with their conclusions.