



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17280

Title: Hepatic fat quantification magnetic resonance for monitoring treatment response in pediatric nonalcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 01562153

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-02-27 10:41

Date reviewed: 2015-02-27 23:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the authors evaluated the possibility of treatment effect monitoring using hepatic fat quantification MR in pediatric nonalcoholic steatohepatitis (NASH). They found that dual-echo fat fraction and triple-echo fat fraction measured by MR, alanine aminotransferase, total cholesterol and triglyceride levels were significantly decreased in the compliant group. The authors concluded that hepatic fat quantification MR can be a non-invasive, quantitative and useful tool as for monitoring treatment effects in pediatric nonalcoholic steatohepatitis. This is a retrospective study. The priority of this manuscript was not high. However, this study may provide useful information for the pediatric doctors to manage the NASH patients. Comment The authors should conduct analyses on the correlation between the decrease of body weight (& BMI) the reduction of fat fraction measured by MR.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17280

Title: Hepatic fat quantification magnetic resonance for monitoring treatment response in pediatric nonalcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 01798570

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-02-27 10:41

Date reviewed: 2015-03-14 16:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors evaluated that hepatic fat quantification MR can be a non-invasive, quantitative and useful tool for monitoring treatment effects in pediatric nonalcoholic steatohepatitis. the issue known in adult population. the manuscript may contribute some information in pediatrician But this is a retrospective study and follow up time is relatively short. its seems to be 27 children evaluated in this study. but authors said that 49 children received the study. 22 children has not been evaluated in this study. There are some spelling errors. Spelling errors should be corrected. The priority of this manuscript is not high.



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17280

Title: Hepatic fat quantification magnetic resonance for monitoring treatment response in pediatric nonalcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 01800318

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-02-27 10:41

Date reviewed: 2015-03-04 05:44

Table with 4 columns: CLASSIFICATION, LANGUAGE EVALUATION, SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT, CONCLUSION. It contains checkboxes for various evaluation criteria like 'Grade A: Excellent', 'Priority publishing', 'Google Search', etc.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is an interesting field and this Paper could contribute to our best knowledge, however there are many grammar and syntax errors. Furthermore, authors don't mention how they obtain the compliance of Children to the diet and exercise! Also they don't mention if Children received the same treatment except Vit E and the diet and exercise. In Material and Method they mention 49 Children, however in statistical analysis they include just 27, without to refer why they exclude the rest 22 Children! In the discussion, they refer in detail to technics for the evaluation of fat, while they should do it in brief into the introduction. So my suggestion is to rewrite the paper clarifying all these aforementioned issues. Other parts that need improvements or clarification are the following: 1)In the introduction section: "Moreover, the risk of radiation exposure is a major disadvantage, especially in children. No studies currently compare CT assessment of hepatic steatosis in Children" Compare with what??? 2)In Material and Method section "Nutrition was recommended as a low caloric diet (25 ~ 30 Kcal/kg/day), made up of fat (25 ~ 30%), carbohydrate (50 ~ 60%) and protein (15 ~ 20%). Fatty acid was composed as followed by the Italian recommendation dietary allowances



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

with recommendation with a moderate exercise program (1 hour/day at least 5 days a week) (22). Vitamin E (daily dose of 800 IU) was also recommended to all patients for improvement of liver histology [23]". There are grammar and syntax errors!Furthermore, there is not only one fatty acid, but plenty of them. 3)In statistical analysis: "Patients who followed the educational recommendations and showed remarkable interval changes in BMI, AST, and ALT during one year under observation" The compliance in educational/dietary recommendations was based only in patients' statements? 4)In results section:"27 children underwent both a pre-treatment and a follow up MR during this period and were included in this study . There were 24 boys and three girls..." The other 22 children why were not included in the study population? "...Table 2 shows the results of initial and follow-up findings in the two groups. Body weight did not change" Did change, but not significantly!