BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 17424
Title: β-elemene enhances radiosensitivity of gastric cancer cells through inhibition of Pak1 activation
Reviewer's code: 03004155
Reviewer's country: China
Science editor: Jing Yu
Date sent for review: 2015-03-07 16:23
Date reviewed: 2015-04-21 16:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present data suggesting that β-elemene enhances the radiosensitivity of gastric cancer cells via up-regulation of PAK1IP1 (p21-activated protein kinase-interacting protein 1) and down-regulation of phospho-Pak1 (T423) and phospho-ERK1/2. The therapeutic potential of β-elemene as a radiosensitizer for gastric cancer may be worth pursuing. This is an interesting work. However, one main issue should be addressed before resubmission: The manuscript is devoid of direct evidences indicating that β-elemene enhances the radiosensitivity of gastric cancer cells via up-regulation of PAK1IP1. It is recommended to detect the effects of alteration of PAK1IP1 expression (overexpression and knockdown) on the β-elemene-induced radiosensitivity of gastric cancer cells. Additionally, some grammar errors were occurred in the manuscript. For example, In Page 2 Line 9 "β-elemene pretreatment with decreased clonogenic survival following ionizing radiation (IR) and increased radiation-induced cell death in MKN45 and SGC7901 gastric cancer cell lines." The word "with" in this sentence should be deleted. It is strongly recommended to double check the whole manuscript before resubmission.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 17424
Title: β-elemene enhances radiosensitivity of gastric cancer cells through inhibition of Pak1 activation
Reviewer's code: 03270395
Reviewer's country: China
Science editor: Jing Yu
Date sent for review: 2015-03-07 16:23
Date reviewed: 2015-04-17 10:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

ESPS Manuscript NO: 17424 Title: β-elemene enhances radiosensitivity of gastric cancer cells through inhibition of Pak1 activation This manuscript is interesting and valuable to explore the potential of β-elemene as a radiosensitizer for gastric cancer cells. However, I have a question about your experiment. 1) MTT assay was adopted to determine that which gastric cancer cell line was not sensitive to the IR, and at the same time Clonogenic survival assay was adopted to observe thether ?-elemente could promote the cell killing effection of IR on the cancer lines. My question is that why don`t you use the same kind of method, such as MTT assay, to study the two experiment, which would make the results more convincing.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 17424
Title: β-elemene enhances radiosensitivity of gastric cancer cells through inhibition of Pak1 activation
Reviewer's code: 03270499
Reviewer's country: United States
Science editor: Jing Yu
Date sent for review: 2015-03-07 16:23
Date reviewed: 2015-04-23 05:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting work. However, some issues should be addressed before resubmission: 1) From Figure1, the clonogenic survival of SGC7901, MKN28, and N87 are quite similar, would you please show all data of three cell lines which would make the results more convincing. 2) Figure 5, β-elemene increased the expression of Pak1-interacting protein 1 (PAK1IP1) in gastric cancer cells. Since PAK1IP1 was demonstrated to be a negative regulatory molecule of Pak1, here is the question, how about the expression level of PAK1IP1 after ionizing radiation treatment? Would you please show PAK1IP1 expression level in figure 5B and 5C? 3) You did clonogenic survival assay and apoptosis detection assay in MKN45 and SGC7901, But there is no western blot result of MKN45. 4) For Figure 8 and 9, please clarify the cell type for those two experiments.