

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16658

Title: Natural evolution of hepatitis C virus infection in hemodialysis Tunisian patients and CTLA-4 SNP's

Reviewer's code: 02444774

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-01-27 09:08

Date reviewed: 2015-01-27 09:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It was a nicely performed study about the polymorphisms of CTLA-4 gene involved in the response against HVC infection in Tunisian patients. The sample size was respectable. Major comments: 1. There would be other factors relevant to the clearance of the virus, e.g. HCV viral load, presence of cirrhosis, use of immunosuppressants etc. These factors should be considered. Minor comments: 1. All the tables and figures should be put at the end of the manuscript. 2. Colour figure may not be necessary.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16658

Title: Natural evolution of hepatitis C virus infection in hemodialysis Tunisian patients and CTLA-4 SNP's

Reviewer's code: 00742516

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-01-27 09:08

Date reviewed: 2015-02-01 10:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I am glad to review the original paper by Ksiaa Cheikhrouhou L. et al. The following is my comments on this paper. 1. The only positive finding of this study is that the distribution of the GG haplotype is different between hemodialysed patients positive for HCV antibody and healthy controls. However, this finding does not demonstrate that this haplotype is associated with susceptibility to HCV infection, because the cases are hemodialysed patients and the underlying renal diseases may be associated with the haplotype. A control group of hemodialysed patients negative for HCV antibody is necessary. 2. As the authors only determined two SNPs in CTLA-4 gene, I think "genetic association" in the title would be too broad. 3. In the method section, the authors mentioned that logistic regression models were used to evaluate the relationships with the different factors (including confounders) and to estimate adjusted ORs. However, I do not find which factors are adjusted in the following content. 4. Statistical results can be listed in the pre-existing tables. 5. Decimal point should be a point. DS should be SD (standard deviation). IC95% should be 95% CI.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16658

Title: Natural evolution of hepatitis C virus infection in hemodialysis Tunisian patients and CTLA-4 SNP's

Reviewer's code: 00181530

Reviewer's country: Bangladesh

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-01-27 09:08

Date reviewed: 2015-02-02 15:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an excellent article from Tunisia that described a retrospective prospective study on "Natural evolution of HCV infection in hemodialysis Tunisian patients and genetic associations". It included 500 patients, of them 307 were followed prospectively on viral molecular level for viral persistence and viral clearance. This scientific work is an excellent work, require minor correction: 1. There are spelling mistake in abstract and in article. 2. Nothing is described in abstract about genetic influence on persistence and clearance of virus before conclusion. 3. In abstract conclusion of "The study of other susceptibility genes for HCV infection will certainly allow a better understanding of the molecular mechanisms is of spontaneous viral clearance or persistence of HCV infection. Such studies can provide data that will predict the natural history of HCV infection and response to treatment" is not relevant to the present study. 4. In results table 2, How results are expressed? eg. N (%) 5. In discussion: Our study show an increase in the number of women in G2 compared to men (133f / 127h). It is not understandable. 6. Our study shows no association between the polymorphisms studied and spontaneous clearance or persistence of HCV infection; it is a major finding could be



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

included in conclusion. 7. There are so many references in discussion without reference number eg (Chang et al 2007; Howard et al. 2002).