

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17702

**Title:** Laparoscopic versus open abdominoperineal resection in the multimodality management of rectal cancer: a case-matched study of short-term outcomes

**Reviewer's code:** 00042186

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2015-03-20 10:56

**Date reviewed:** 2015-04-20 15:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is an interesting manuscript in which 106 laparoscopic APR are compared to 106 open APR. Before publishing, some explanation are requested to authors: 1) METHODS: In which way did you choose a patient for Laparoscopic or Open APR? 2) In follow up: metachronous metastasis, local recurrence and 5 cases of postoperative mortality are described. It could be important define the when they occurred after surgery.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17702

**Title:** Laparoscopic versus open abdominoperineal resection in the multimodality management of rectal cancer: a case-matched study of short-term outcomes

**Reviewer's code:** 00042961

**Reviewer's country:** Belgium

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2015-03-20 10:56

**Date reviewed:** 2015-04-21 13:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Authors, The benefits of laparoscopy in digestive cancer surgery and particularly in colorectal surgery are increasingly confirmed. In case of rectal cancer, the benefit of laparoscopy is more recent. Several references are cited by the authors (this reference could be added: A randomized trial of laparoscopic versus open surgery for rectal cancer. N Engl J Med 2015 Apr 2; 372 (14): 1324-1332). Furthermore the robotic surgery is increasingly used but the advantages over laparoscopy are not yet clearly proven. This article is well written and well documented. The number of patients is important, and the team has good surgical results. Laparoscopy offers clear advantages found in large series and in your study. But we must not forget that the oncological outcome prevails. Laparoscopy and open surgery gives similar oncologic results. The surgeon must perform the procedure using the technique he mastered the best (even if open surgery is chosen).