

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18623

Title: Molecular prognostic prediction in liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 00002356

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-26 18:34

Date reviewed: 2015-05-05 18:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Excellent and comprehensive review. I only have two issues that need to be addressed by the authors to increase the significance of this manuscript. 1. The authors should discuss the issue of molecular intratumoral heterogeneity, and also the potential heterogeneity between different tumor nodules in the same patient. This is important in practical terms regarding their proposed application of molecular profiling for patient prognosis and molecular therapies. 2. A brief description of the most adequate technological platforms that in the opinion of the authors could be used in the clinical setting to achieve a robust molecular profiling of tumors and liver tissues. Minor. In page 10, second paragraph, the words "of successful clinical translation" are repeated twice in the same sentence.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18623

Title: Molecular prognostic prediction in liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 00001541

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-26 18:34

Date reviewed: 2015-05-04 15:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review by Goossens et al on ""Molecular prognostic prediction in liver cirrhosis"" is a well written report on clinical and molecular markers determining prognosis for disease progression and HCC occurrence or recurrence in cirrhotic patients. However I have a point to make. In liver cirrhosis IGF-I synthesis drops in parallel to hepatocellular insufficiency and its levels reflect the decline in liver function more precisely than albumin, INR or bilirubin values. In addition IGF-I expression in the cirrhotic peritumor tissue is on top of the molecular signature prognosticating HCC recurrence after resection. Thus, IGF-I is a marker that needs to be included and commented in this review