

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18461

Title: Modulation of host lipid metabolism by HCV: role of new therapies

Reviewer's code: 00504141

Reviewer's country: Ireland

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-22 14:40

Date reviewed: 2015-05-13 23:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a short review on modulation of lipid metabolism in HCV infection. The review is not over burdened with detailed information and this enhances the readability of the manuscript. However, there are a few areas that would benefit from further information. Some figures are necessary and will benefit the manuscript. A figure on lipid metabolism and the engagement with HCV proteins is one such figure required. The authors are advised to be wary of using "cure". While the new DAAs are very efficacious, there is a failure rate, small, but it exists. The term cure, really awaits more prospective studies. Page 5, references 36-38, expand on this information. References are needed for several statements throughout the manuscript. This is a worthwhile manuscript in that it describes some of the relevant literature in an uncluttered manner. It could be enhanced by detailing a section on viral replication and the intimate involvement of lipid.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18461

Title: Modulation of host lipid metabolism by HCV: role of new therapies

Reviewer's code: 00503536

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-22 14:40

Date reviewed: 2015-06-06 10:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review manuscript written by Del Campo et al. summarizes the association of lipid metabolism and HCV replication. They further suggest the contribution of lipid metabolism to the effect of DAA therapy. The review is well written and provides important information on the role of lipid metabolism in the treatment of HCV infection. It would be much better to show a summarized figure.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18461

Title: Modulation of host lipid metabolism by HCV: role of new therapies

Reviewer's code: 00003361

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-22 14:40

Date reviewed: 2015-06-22 05:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a review of the literature pertinent to the changes induced in lipid metabolism by the HCV virus infection. The virus uses host lipid products and pathways during its replication cycle. This in turn is dependent on viral factors and host lipid-related enzyme and protein polymorphisms. The review is a useful summary of current literature. Specific comments: 1. Page 4 line 13 – define “FASN” as listed here and its effect on lipid metabolism. 2. Page 4 line 4 from bottom – start a new paragraph with the sentence starting “Adiponutrin or patain-like...” 3. The review could be improved by the addition of a table or diagram that lists the lipid enzymes, lipoproteins, and genetic polymorphisms that are involved or modulated during HCV infection. 4. Page 7 line 2 from bottom. The issue of how statins may be used clinically to improve HCV treatment is potentially important. Could the authors perhaps expand on this and include a discussion of Rao et al. Gastroenterology 2011;140:144-152.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18461

Title: Modulation of host lipid metabolism by HCV: role of new therapies

Reviewer's code: 00053786

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-22 14:40

Date reviewed: 2015-06-17 01:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Jose A del Campo and Manuel Romero-Gomez have presented an updated overview of the role of HCV in the modulation of the host lipid metabolism. The paper is well-written and structured. It clearly explains the involvement of the viral and host factors that participate in this interaction and the effect of new antiviral therapies. My comments: Please revise the English language for some misspelled words and wordiness (too long sentences). Please add one or two figures to enhance your work. Thank you

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18461

Title: Modulation of host lipid metabolism by HCV: role of new therapies

Reviewer's code: 00503530

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-22 14:40

Date reviewed: 2015-06-17 06:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

About hepatitis C viral infection and the lipid metabolism of the host, authors gather it up well. In real treatment, how is the treatment result? When fatty liver, hyperlipemia, obesity are complicated, how long do results change in the ratio of? I think that this point should increase.