BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 18684
Title: Review of transvaginal Hybrid-NOTES cholecystectomy - systematic analysis of safety and benefit of a new procedure
Reviewer's code: 02550162
Reviewer's country: United States
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2015-04-27 18:03
Date reviewed: 2015-06-11 03:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations to the authors on a very good paper on this relatively new topic. I think this paper is for the most part all written, with good information. There are certainly limitations to the database data for example, but this is addressed in the manuscript. One main problem I had was that this is really several different studies combined into one paper. I found it difficult to follow. Perhaps because the methods were each listed, and then the results. I found myself losing track of which study was done with which methods. I'm not sure the main editors would prefer this another way though: either as separate papers, or by separating each component of the study. Meaning to put the methods and then the results of each sub-component before proceeding to the next one. Maybe that seems a little strange going back from results to methods, but I think it might be easier for the reader to keep track.