

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18830

Title: Colitis-Associated Colon Cancer: Is it in Your Genes?

Reviewer's code: 03001891

Reviewer's country: Saudi Arabia

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-05-04 16:01

Date reviewed: 2015-05-04 22:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I read with interest the article titled "Colitis-Associated Colon Cancer: Is it in Your Genes?", which summarized in detail genetic predisposition to CRC in IBD with a clear focus on mouse models. In general, this is a well written paper. While I understand that the authors have focused on the basic science behind this phenomenon, I have a few points that I would like to critique for the purpose of improving the paper, especially for clinicians in the audience: - I find it surprising that I could not find any mention of PSC, as a strong risk factor for CRC in IBD, anywhere in the paper. Why is there such a huge risk associated with PSC from the basic science perspective and is there a genetic component there as well? can modelling and extrapolation be done from this subset of patients to try and understand the molecular basis behind CRC development in IBD? - I also find it surprising that the most controversial point of this clinical situation is only lightly discussed (page 5): do 5ASA agents actually reduce the risk of CRC in UC? there has been a lot of controversy around this issue and I think for the average reader of such an article this needs to be tackled with more vigour, do other agents reduce this risk as well e.g. UDCA? - There is mention of increased numbers of prophylactic colectomy on page 8, please clarify if this is for patients with familial predisposition to



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

CRC or IBD patients?, if its the latter where is the data to support this claim? - On page 4 there is a statement that suggests that the incidence of CRC is almost equal between UC and colonic CD, the reference for this statement is very old, is there a more updated reference that can be used? also, please indicate that only a small proportion of CD patients have isolated colonic disease as this is clinically relevant. - In the summary of risk factors of CRC in IBD, some other risk factors should be added to the list such as shortened colon, pseudo-polyps, histologic inflammation, PSC, family history,.....etc - Should a brief mention of surveillance be included? I will leave this part to the editors to decide?