

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17219

**Title:** HBV Infection and Genotype in asymptomatic people from 10 ethnic groups in Yunnan, China

**Reviewer's code:** 02441405

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2015-02-26 11:44

**Date reviewed:** 2015-03-10 23:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript identified the genotypic difference of HBV isolated from the people with different ethnicity in Yunnan, China, based upon molecular epidemiological study. Results are interesting and may have potential impact on the prevention and management of HBV infection among different ethnic groups. Several suggestions and comment: 1. In Introduction, following sentence is inaccurate: "One-third of the world's population, or approximately 2 billion people, are infected with HBV, and there are approximately 380 million people with chronic HBV worldwide". According to official WHO website, more than 2 000 million people alive today HAVE BEEN infected with HBV at some time in their lives, but this does not mean all of them ARE still infected. In fact, only about 350 million remain infected chronically and become carriers of the virus. Please revise this sentence to be more accurate. 2. Regarding the reliability of defining ethnicity, do people living in the "villages" have the same ethnic background? What is the extent or degree of the migration- in and -out from the "villages"? 3. In Result, it is stated "Genotype B accounted for 50% of those with a northern origin; C, 25%; and BC, 25%. For those ethnic groups with a southern origin, the genotype

distribution was 73.9% for B, 17.4% for C, and 8.7% for BC". Based upon above observation, it appears that genotype B is dominant in both southern and northern origins. However, in Discussion, "The HBV genotype distribution pattern in China is dominated by genotype C in the north and B in the south, with a lower prevalence of BC (6.1%) [22]. the genotype B and C distribution were consistent with this pattern, genotype B is dominant with prevalence at 59.6%". The observation and the conclusion seem inconsistent. 4. Some minor grammatical errors: a. In Abstract, result section: two types of infection model (should be plural). b. In Introduction, page 3, last sentence: region (should be plural). c. Page 4, the second paragraph, suggest to revise "Infection and genotype ethnic distribution are remained unclear" to "Infection and genotype ethnic distribution remains unclear". d. Page 11, line 6, provinces (should be plural). e. Page 11, line 7, suggest to revise "this is the time Yunnan start its development" to "when Yunnan started its development". f. Page 11, lines 8-9", suggest to revise " Thus, HBV genotype distribution can be shaped both by historical genomic backgrounds of people and also current influenced driven by development" To "Thus, HBV genotype distribution can be shaped by both historical genomic backgrounds of people and economical development". g. Page 11,line 21: Suggest to change "between"" to " among" h. Page 11, line 22, delete "both".

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17219

**Title:** HBV Infection and Genotype in asymptomatic people from 10 ethnic groups in Yunnan, China

**Reviewer's code:** 00182548

**Reviewer's country:** Romania

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2015-02-26 11:44

**Date reviewed:** 2015-03-13 02:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting and important epidemiological study. The methodology is presented exhaustively and the results are discussed in comparison with previous data from literature. The study was expensive and involved a large volume of work. The next sentence from abstract is not correct: "HBsAg-positive rate and the proportion of genotype B were significantly lower in ethnic groups with a northern origin". The authors must add: compared to those of southern origin. There are some grammatical errors that must be corrected (e.g.: "The difference were..." "statistically significance difference", etc). In my opinion, after making corrections, the article may be published.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17219

**Title:** HBV Infection and Genotype in asymptomatic people from 10 ethnic groups in Yunnan, China

**Reviewer's code:** 00071717

**Reviewer's country:** Turkey

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2015-02-26 11:44

**Date reviewed:** 2015-03-15 22:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Some concerns; 1-A study by Wang B et al. found genotype C at 62.5% hepatitis B patients in Yunan (Wang B, Feng Y, Li Z, Duan H, Zhao T, Zhang A, Liu L, Baloch Z, Xia X Distribution and diversity of hepatitis B virus genotypes in Yunnan, China. J Med Virol. 2014 Oct;86(10):1675-82. doi: 10.1002/jmv.24002. Epub 2014 Jul 3.). But authors found that the major genotype is B (59.6%) in Yunan. How do authors explain this diversity? Author's explanations are not satisfactory. 2-The study design is good but the group consists of a small sample size.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17219

**Title:** HBV Infection and Genotype in asymptomatic people from 10 ethnic groups in Yunnan, China

**Reviewer's code:** 00043980

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2015-02-26 11:44

**Date reviewed:** 2015-03-16 06:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

We have carefully evaluated this new manuscript. This manuscript describes a prospective epidemiological study on the rate and genotype of hepatitis B virus infection in Yunnan, China. The authors have clearly outlined their hypothesis for the study. The study design and methods were described in a very detailed manner, especially regarding sample testing techniques. Our concerns are that: The inclusion and exclusion criteria of the selected patient population are not described. Statistical analysis was only mentioned briefly with software listed. This manuscript is at times difficult to read due to grammatical and structural errors. Many of these errors are listed below in greater detail. It is unclear at this time why the results of this study are important. The authors do not mention whether the various genotypes and subgenotypes of HBV are clinically relevant with regards to treatment or prognosis. Errors to Correct Include: Page 2, line 2: please define the acronym "HBV" prior to usage Page 3, lines 13-16: run-on sentence, consider revising Page 3, line 22: numerous grammatical errors, consider revising "...mixed genotypes occur more in regions with a multi-ethnic..." Page 4, line 5: change "characters" to "characteristics" Page 4,



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

line 6: change "are remained" to "remain" Pages 4-8: numbering of sections is done incorrectly. For example on page 4, "materials and methods" is given the header "1". This should be followed by subheading "1.1 Materials" rather than "2.1 Materials". Page 10, line 2: consider revision of this fragment for better comprehension Page 10, lines 19-22 and Page 11, line 1: run-on sentence, consider revision for better comprehension Page 11, line 6: pluralize "province" Page 11, lines 7-9: consider revision for better comprehension Page 11, line 12: Capitalize "this" Page 11, line 19: pluralize "study" Page 12, line 1: this last sentence fragment does not make sense; consider revision