

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21048

Title: Coexistence of hepatoma with mantle cell lymphoma in a hepatitis B carrier

Reviewer's code: 02528327

Reviewer's country: Australia

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-06-28 18:31

Date reviewed: 2015-07-13 12:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The submitted manuscript represents a case report about a male patient chronically infected with hepatitis B virus (HBV). The patient had enlarged lymph nodes in the neck and inguinal regions, and a tumor in the Caunaud's segment 7. The case report describes an interesting case with lymphoid cells infiltrating the hepatocellular carcinoma. The authors should clarify or discuss whether there is an evidence of a wider infiltration into the liver tissue or exclusively into the hepatocellular carcinoma. Also, please state whether there was any evidence for a spread into the gastrointestinal tract and/or bone marrow. Comments: - Abstract: Avoid "huge", please define it. - Abstract: Please re-phrase, "7 cm liver mass". "cm" is not a unit of mass. Maybe "a liver section in the size of" - Introduction: "HBV has been suggested to be both lymphotropic and hepatotropic" - Please change. HBV is hepatotropic, and there may be some evidence that peripheral blood mononuclear cells (PBMCs) can serve as a reservoir (Pontisso P., et al. 2008. Autoimmunity Reviews 8: 13-17, and references therein). - Figs. 1-4: please mark the region of interests "low density mass" and "central necrosis" with arrows and/or arrow heads. - In the section "Diagnostic test": Figure 5B listed before Fig 5A. Please keep the appropriate order. - Section "Diagnostic test": ".. that it was a

HCC (Figure 5B). A right inguinal lymph ...” Context unclear. Possibly, following the assessment of the pathology of the liver tumor, the pathology for the enlarged lymph nodes were established. Please clarify. - Please show in Fig. 5 (arrows, arrow heads) the localisation of the aggregates formed by the lymphoid cells. - Figs. 6: Control stain required, in the absence of primary antibody. Figure legend or text should provide the information, which primary and secondary antibodies were used (commercial provider), detection by immunoperoxidase staining? - Discussion: “ ... in patients with both HCV infection and liver cirrhosis” provide reference(s). - Discussion: “ In the present case, the patient had not received Moreover, two clinical or pathological evidences of HCV are found”. Unclear, please clarify. If HCV positive, please provide more details regarding the HCV infection, and the two clinical or pathological evidences. - Discussion lists outcomes of individual published case reports, but summary would be required. - Discussion “HBV particles can then infect other lymphocytes ...” reference required which shows that lymphocytes are permissive for HBV. - Please introduce abbreviations when used for the first time in the manuscript, for instance Hematoxylin and eosin (H&E) stain