

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21555

Title: Reduction of the ages at diagnosis and operation of biliary atresia in Taiwan: A 15-year population-based cohort study

Reviewer's code: 02861333

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-20 17:08

Date reviewed: 2015-07-21 19:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study analyzed the ages at diagnosis and operation of biliary atresia in Taiwan and found that the ages at diagnosis and operation in biliary atresia have decreased over time and Kasai operation performed at younger age reduces the need for liver transplantation. The results indicated the Kasai operation at younger age. However, there was no significant different between those patients who received the Kasai operation within 60 days of age and those who received the operation over 60 days of age ($p = 0.133$) So, the conclusion should be more precisely.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21555

Title: Reduction of the ages at diagnosis and operation of biliary atresia in Taiwan: A 15-year population-based cohort study

Reviewer's code: 01944014

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-20 17:08

Date reviewed: 2015-08-07 16:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for submitting a nice manuscript. It is a well designed multi center, national cohort study, that showed a very impressive finding. major points: 1. Have you compared the overall survival rate among 3 groups? 2. I suggest to add percentages of healthy survivors without LT according to 3 phases, which could reveal the effectiveness of early Kasai operation. minor points: 1 Kasai operation performed at younger age could have reduced the need for LT, but there was no statistical significance. I suggest to modify your conclusion. 2. It would be better to add the limitation of your study at the end of the discussion.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21555

Title: Reduction of the ages at diagnosis and operation of biliary atresia in Taiwan: A 15-year population-based cohort study

Reviewer's code: 00158730

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-20 17:08

Date reviewed: 2015-07-23 07:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Nicely done 2. There are several errors that need correction. For example in the intro. "The Kasai operation (hepatoportoenterostomy) as the primary surgical treatment for BA cases is recommended to be performed as early as good[1, 2, 5, 6], because increased age at the time of surgery may result in a deleterious effect on the outcomes of BA cases[2, 4, 7]. " I assume you meant as early as possible not "as early as good." You should have someone familiar with English proofread your manuscript and revise it so your meaning is correct stated.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21555

Title: Reduction of the ages at diagnosis and operation of biliary atresia in Taiwan: A 15-year population-based cohort study

Reviewer's code: 02447059

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-20 17:08

Date reviewed: 2015-08-10 18:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors aimed to describe the ages at diagnosis and operation of biliary atresia (BA) and its incidence over a 15-year period in Taiwan. They found that the age at diagnosis and Kasai was significantly reduced, and attributed this decrease for better awareness, stool color screening programs and better improvement in medical care services in addition to availability of transplant grafts. Though it is purely descriptive, yet the findings in interesting, but still need better analysis. comments: 1- present the age by median and range in all groups 2- describe the outcome of Kasai in patients operated before 60 and after 60 days 3- present the preoperative data of such patients to justify the later need for liver transplant. (the issue is not always the age at diagnosis, other factors may intervene such as grade of portal fibrosis) 4- the different findings by Tiao and Lin is not explained by the annual incidence in this study. It is matching with their finding and NOT an explanation. The authors need to postulate another explanation. 5- In figure 2, it is better to indicate the birth rate/year, which may be related to the increased or decreased cases of BA. It may be just a percent of increased or decreased total. 6- Type of graft in liver transplant (cadaveric or



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

living-related) may be related to the change of age of transplant. please present these data and then analyze minor comments 1- English language needs careful revision 2- abbreviations must be spelled out at first appearance.