BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 12206
Title: Sorafenib for perioperative treatment of liver transplantation:a time-to-event meta-analysis
Reviewer code: 00054465
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2014-06-28 22:27
Date reviewed: 2014-07-01 20:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good attempt at a meta analysis to assess the efficacy of sorafenib therapy on patients with liver cancer treated by transplantation. Unfortunately only 4 articles meet inclusion criteria and none are RCTs and 3 do not provide hazard ratios but do have survival curves that the authors analyze. I am not sure that this limited number of trials with limited retrospective data meet the criteria for a meta analysis. I believe this is more a systematic review of available data. However it is interesting but not sound data that has undergone a rigorous review but this does not result in convincing results. The limited and weak data analyzed only give weak results. However it is interesting and if reported in this context would be of interest

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 12206
Title: Sorafenib for perioperative treatment of liver transplantation:a time-to-event meta-analysis
Reviewer code: 00504311
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2014-06-28 22:27
Date reviewed: 2014-07-02 11:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[Y] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Existing	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you very much for requesting my review of the manuscript titled: " Sorafenib for perioperative treatment of liver transplantation:a time-to-event meta-analysis by Dr. Haolong Qi and co-Authors, This is a very interesting paper with a high number of reported patients taking sorafenib perioperational period of liver transplantation. This is a very important issue because in the literature recently some researchers have warned about whether sorafenib could improve patients' survive during perioperational period of liver transplantation, so this meta-analysis give us a clear answer, and so I think it can be published in the WJG. Thanks!

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 12206
Title: Sorafenib for perioperative treatment of liver transplantation:a time-to-event meta-analysis
Reviewer code: 00054317
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2014-06-28 22:27
Date reviewed: 2014-07-15 01:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[Y] Grade E: Poor	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Existing	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The Authors do a lot of reading in reviewing 104 pieces of work to end up with only 4 publications about Sorafenib use in HCC, before and after transplant, that can be used for a meta-analysis of safety and efficacy. The concept and methodology used is appropriate but the English prose must be completely redone to make it suitable for publication.