

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11474

Title: A Successful Treatment of Conversion Chemotherapy for Initially Unresectable Synchronous Colorectal Liver Metastasis.

Reviewer code: 00068625

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-05-26 08:45

Date reviewed: 2014-05-31 23:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the manuscript the authors focused on preoperative chemotherapy of colorectal cancer with synchronous liver metastases. The topics are covered very well and thoroughly. The paper is organized in a clear and easy to understand manner; however, the cited references are too numerous. The Discussion section reiterates some concepts already presented, whereas one would expect a personal interpretation of the results and some suggestions to move forward. Some of the information from discussion should be included in the introduction of the paper. To sum up, the work provides novel information and deserves publishing after minor essential improvements.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11474

Title: A Successful Treatment of Conversion Chemotherapy for Initially Unresectable Synchronous Colorectal Liver Metastasis.

Reviewer code: 00004187

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-05-26 08:45

Date reviewed: 2014-06-04 05:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Is a unique case which confirms previously published data in previous studies. It adds nothing to the known. References: Akgül O, Cetinkaya E, Ersöz S, Tez M. Role of surgery in colorectal cancer liver metastases. World J Gastroenterol. 2014 May 28;20(20):6113-6122. Review. PubMed PMID: 24876733; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC4033450. Kishi Y, Madoff DC, Abdalla EK, Palavecino M, Ribero D, Chun YS, Vauthey JN. Is embolization of segment 4 portal veins before extended right hepatectomy justified? Surgery. 2008 Nov;144(5):744-51. doi: 10.1016/j.surg.2008.05.015. Epub 2008 Aug 10. PubMed PMID: 19081016. Ribero D, Chun YS, Vauthey JN. Standardized liver volumetry for portal vein embolization. Semin Intervent Radiol. 2008 Jun;25(2):104-9. doi: 10.1055/s-2008-1076681. PubMed PMID: 21326551; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC3036478. Chun YS, Ribero D, Abdalla EK, Madoff DC, Mortenson MM, Wei SH, Vauthey JN. Comparison of two methods of future liver remnant volume measurement. J Gastrointest Surg. 2008 Jan;12(1):123-8. Epub 2007 Oct 9. PubMed PMID: 17924174. Chun YS, Vauthey JN, Ribero D, Donadon M, Mullen JT, Eng C, Madoff DC, Chang DZ, Ho L, Kopetz S, Wei SH, Curley SA, Abdalla EK. Systemic chemotherapy and two-stage hepatectomy for extensive bilateral colorectal liver metastases: perioperative safety and survival. J Gastrointest Surg. 2007 Nov;11(11):1498-504; discussion 1504-5. Epub 2007 Sep 11. PubMed PMID: 17849166. Hasegawa K, Takahashi M, Ohba M, Kaneko J, Aoki T, Sakamoto Y, Sugawara Y, Kokudo N. Perioperative chemotherapy and liver resection for hepatic metastases of colorectal cancer. J Hepatobiliary Pancreat Sci. 2012 Sep;19(5):503-8. doi: 10.1007/s00534-012-0509-7. Review. PubMed PMID: 22426591.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11474

Title: A Successful Treatment of Conversion Chemotherapy for Initially Unresectable Synchronous Colorectal Liver Metastasis.

Reviewer code: 00289387

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-05-26 08:45

Date reviewed: 2014-06-09 02:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors presented a case report of sigmoid colorectal cancer with synchronous colorectal cancer liver metastasis (CRLM) that successfully received liver tumor removal and demonstrated recurrence-free over 18 months following the operation in a 72-year old patient. The description of chemotherapy, picture presentation of 3 figures, and discussion for the report are clear and reasonable, which may hold the promise in the efficacious approach for CRLM in future. A few concerns should be addressed to enhance the report. 1) It may clarify if the patient was diagnosed with primary colorectal cancer prior to the transfer to authors' hospital. 2) Figure 2 the label "CEA" in the Y-axis is missing. 3) The liver pathological images showed a phenotype of tumors with well to moderate tumor cell differentiation, which might account for the non-invasiveness observed in the liver such as well responses to the chemotherapy and the right hepatic vein and the inferior vena cava free from tumor invasion following the chemotherapy. This suggests that tumor cell differentiation status in tissue biopsy may serve as one of the indicators essential for the liver surgery of CRLM. Thus, this rationale for future therapeutic decision should be added in the Discussion.