

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13237

Title: The negative impact of bone-marrow-derived mesenchymal stem cells on DSS-induced colitis

Reviewer code: 00013033

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-08-13 19:43

Date reviewed: 2014-08-14 04:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting, though negative paper. It investigates a novel potentially interesting therapeutic area. Comments; 1. Methodology is partly appropriate it is not clear why authors only studied ip administration but not intravenous therapy. This should be done and it would be interesting to study the outcomes in a Crohn animal model. 2. In addition, this is an "acute colitis" model, and results may not be generalizable to other, e.g. chronic colitis models. Authors should consider repeating the experiments at least in another colitis model. 3. Authors should add animal numbers for each assessment/Figures/subgroup 4. The paper is too long; results should be more focused and compact, delete duplicate information presented also as Figures, additionally, some figures should be also omitted.