



ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11748

Title: Clinical significance and usefulness of soluble HB-EGF in gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 01190357

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-06-02 21:11

Date reviewed: 2014-06-24 20:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript authors studied the clinical usefulness of soluble heparin-binding EGF-like growth factor as a biomarker for gastric cancer. HB-EGF is overexpressed in several cancer cell lines and cancer tissues including human gastric cancer tissues. HB-EGF is also reported to be involved in malignant phenotype and chemo-resistance of cancer cells. Therefore this study would be useful to develop a useful biomarker for gastric cancer diagnosis. The major concern of this manuscript is the value of HB-EGF in serum. This reviewer has an experience to measure the serum HB-EGF level using the ELISA kit purchased from R & D which is identical to the kit used by this authors. This reviewer’s personal data indicated that HB-EGF level in serum was almost 100-1,000 pg/ml in both normal volunteers and cancer patients. The paper published recently also indicated that serum HB-EGF level in ovarian cancer patient was 10-100 pg/ml (Am J Transl Res 2012, 4:415-421). However, in this manuscript authors indicated that average serum HB-EGF levels were about 94.7 and 314.4 ng/ml in normal control group and AGC group, respectively. These values are about thousand times higher than that of reported previously. How did authors determine the value of HB-EGF concentration? At the beginning, this reviewer strongly recommends authors to check the experimental methods, data and evaluation of the data whether they were correctly conducted. The manufacture is not warranting to measure HB-EGF concentration in serum with ELISA kit used for the authors. Therefore, in the second authors should indicate the standard curve for the determination of HB-EGF concentrations by this ELISA method and the method correctly measure



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

serum HB-EGF level.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11748

Title: Clinical significance and usefulness of soluble HB-EGF in gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00181924

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-06-02 21:11

Date reviewed: 2014-06-25 18:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting manuscript with innovative endpoint and potential clinical impact. It would be interesting if there was a fifth group assessing sHB-EGF levels in post-treatment GC patients and investigate the potential usefulness of this biomarker in disease monitoring as well (e.g. if sHB-EGF levels are reduced after gastric cancer management and rebound in disease recurrence). Nevertheless, it could be the subject of another study. Mixing control group patients with normal mucosa and chronic superficial gastritis (CSG) may cloud the results, since gastric inflammation status may affect (increase) sHB-EGF levels comparing to normal mucosa. It would be preferable to distinct these two sub-groups of patients, although the clinical significance of this study is between non-cancer and cancer patients.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11748

Title: Clinical significance and usefulness of soluble HB-EGF in gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 02460289

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-06-02 21:11

Date reviewed: 2014-07-15 15:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

no