

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13170

Title: Detection of HPV DNA in esophageal carcinoma, in Greece

Reviewer code: 00061674

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-08-09 19:37

Date reviewed: 2014-08-17 18:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for the opportunity to review the manuscript "Detection of HPV DNA in esophageal carcinoma, in Greece" for World Journal of Gastroenterology. In this work, the authors investigated the detection of human papillomavirus (HPV) in 19 patients with esophageal squamous cell carcinoma (ESCC) and in 30 individuals without esophageal pathology in their geographical location of Northern Greece. The aim was to investigate the possible relationship between esophageal cancer and HPV in their geographical region. The authors used PCR to detect viral genome which is the most reliable method of investigation. This is an interesting topic because of the unproven role of HPV infection and ESCC in regions with low incidence of HPV infection and ESCC such as Greece. The key conclusion of their work, according to the abstract, is that despite the significant limitation of a small sample size, this is the first study of its kind in our region, and although it does not show a relation between HPV infection and ESCC, the issue does merit further investigation. The authors stated in the Methods that "The study was conducted at the University Hospital and the patients came from the area of Northern Greece." This region may not reflect the incidence of ESCC nor HPV infection in the country as a whole as stated in the title of the paper. Despite this, the authors concluded that "Our data has shown that Greece is a low risk region for HPV-related cancer of the esophagus." This conclusion is not supported by the regional sample of patients that the study investigated. - The authors should explain why they choose the primers they used in the study and provide supporting citation(s). - They should also provide the manufacturer's name & country in all



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

reagents, kits, etc. - The authors mentioned that the biopsies were performed according to a standard protocol. The detail of this protocol should be provided in order to allow evaluation of the validity of the sampling process. - The info for reference 17 is not enough to allow retrieval of this reference. The authors should provide the reference URL. - English language and style should be more clear and readable.