

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13403

Title: Role of synchronous splenectomy and hepatectomy for the patients with hepatocellular carcinoma and hypersplenism: Case-control study

Reviewer code: 01221925

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-08-23 17:01

Date reviewed: 2014-09-05 20:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting paper on the role of splenectomy at the same time as a hepatectomy. Could the authors please respond to the following questions/comments? 1) The paper could benefit from language editorial help 2) What do the authors consider as the mechanism of the decreased recurrence with splenectomy, as opposed to no effect on the overall survival? 3) Was there a difference in postoperative bleeding? 4) Is there potentially a selection bias, given the fact that it is not a randomized study and that the patients were chosen for the combined procedure? The control group should be comprised of patients fulfilling all the criteria for splenectomy Thank you

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13403

Title: Role of synchronous splenectomy and hepatectomy for the patients with hepatocellular carcinoma and hypersplenism: Case-control study

Reviewer code: 02938161

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-08-23 17:01

Date reviewed: 2014-09-07 17:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper should be reviewed by a someone with expertise in English before it can be published in the Journal of "WJG".