

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12632

Title: CDX2 protein expression compared to alcian blue staining in the evaluation of esophageal intestinal metaplasia

Reviewer code: 00181023

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-07-18 09:22

Date reviewed: 2014-09-09 02:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "CDX2 protein expression compared to alcian blue staining in the evaluation of esophageal intestinal metaplasia" is easy to follow and understand. The topic is not really novel, but data are still interesting. Some issues need consideration: 1. The "columnar blues" are usually associated with multilayered epithelium (within the ducts of proper esophageal glands) and with metaplastic cardiac mucosa - please refer to these two types of epithelium in your study cohort: How often did you see multilayered epithelium and how was the positivity for AB and CDX-2? 2. Currently the discussion is rather (!) short, as is the list of references. Some more detailed literature review is necessary which will reveal some more novel papers. I particularly miss (i) Hahn HP et al. Intestinal differentiation in metaplastic, nongoblet columnar epithelium in the esophagus. Am J Surg Pathol 2009 and (ii) Langner C et al. Multilayered epithelium at the gastroesophageal junction is a marker of gastroesophageal reflux disease. Virchows Arch 2014. The latter paper provided an interesting hypothetical flow-chart how intestinal metaplasia may develop at this specific site. 3. Figure 1 needs serial sections. 4. The reference list does not follow journal requirements.