

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14151

Title: Retrospective Observation of the therapeutic effects of Adult Auxiliary Partial Living Donor Liver Transplantation on Postpartum Acute Liver Failure Following HBV: a case report and review of the literature.

Reviewer code: 00502871

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-09-23 19:28

Date reviewed: 2014-09-24 22:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript describes a successful auxiliary living donor liver graft and recovery of liver native liver function in a patient with HBV and postpartum liver failure. This is a remarkable and successful approach to a rare condition.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14151

Title: Retrospective Observation of the therapeutic effects of Adult Auxiliary Partial Living Donor Liver Transplantation on Postpartum Acute Liver Failure Following HBV: a case report and review of the literature.

Reviewer code: 00722219

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-09-23 19:28

Date reviewed: 2014-10-02 03:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Authors, This case report deserves to publication. It should be revised in terms of language editing. Yours sincerely.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14151

Title: Retrospective Observation of the therapeutic effects of Adult Auxiliary Partial Living Donor Liver Transplantation on Postpartum Acute Liver Failure Following HBV: a case report and review of the literature.

Reviewer code: 02445667

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-09-23 19:28

Date reviewed: 2014-10-02 15:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Please add the abstract section.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14151

Title: Retrospective Observation of the therapeutic effects of Adult Auxiliary Partial Living Donor Liver Transplantation on Postpartum Acute Liver Failure Following HBV: a case report and review of the literature.

Reviewer code: 00743117

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-09-23 19:28

Date reviewed: 2014-09-25 20:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled, "Retrospective observation of the therapeutic effects of adult auxiliary partial living donor liver transplantation on postpartum acute liver failure following HBV; a case report and review of literature" by Li CY et al., reported a case of an acute liver failure due to hepatitis B virus (HBV) who underwent auxiliary partial living donor liver transplantation (APOLT) with right living donor liver. In my opinion, the right liver graft of 750g, 0.8% of GRWR, and 50% of SLV may not necessitate APOLT procedure, meaning the conventional right liver procurement will sufficient for the recipient's demand. Moreover, I am afraid that leaving the HBV infected native left liver in the recipient is acceptable as a clinical practice. Yet, readers may be interested in the present findings of periodical liver biopsies of both the graft and the native liver with regard to HBV infection. I have some comments. Comments 1. Please clarify why the authors finally decided to do APOLT this particular case. In my opinion, the right liver graft of 750g, 0.8% of GRWR, and 50% of SLV may not necessitate APOLT procedure, meaning the conventional right liver procurement will sufficient for the recipient's demand. Moreover, I doubt the rightfulness of leaving the HBV infected native left liver in the recipient as a clinical practice. I think that the conventional LDLT and following antiviral prophylaxis with combination therapy is the standard treatment for this particular case. The discussion regarding this point should be made. How did authors consider about the risk of the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

complete abolition of the native liver and the graft failure due to HBV infection? 2. Please demonstrate the dose of HBIG in detail, with the recipient serum level of HBs-Ab titer. We recommend authors to summarize these data in a graph, showing the amount of HBIG, HBs-Ab titer, HBV-DNA titer, liver biopsy timing, start of the antiviral treatment and so on. 3. There is no literature review in the manuscript, so the title had better be corrected as such. 4. There are some grammatical errors in the text. Please perform English proof-reading before re-submitting the manuscript.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14151

Title: Retrospective Observation of the therapeutic effects of Adult Auxiliary Partial Living Donor Liver Transplantation on Postpartum Acute Liver Failure Following HBV: a case report and review of the literature.

Reviewer code: 01560482

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-09-23 19:28

Date reviewed: 2014-09-26 16:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reported a successful APOLT case. APOLT is a life-saving therapy, especially for acute liver failures. Li and the other authors made an appropriate decision and saved the patient's life. In addition, one of the major concerns after transplant is HBV infection, which had been under control according to this manuscript.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14151

Title: Retrospective Observation of the therapeutic effects of Adult Auxiliary Partial Living Donor Liver Transplantation on Postpartum Acute Liver Failure Following HBV: a case report and review of the literature.

Reviewer code: 02731621

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-09-23 19:28

Date reviewed: 2014-10-09 03:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript was poorly written. 1. we know that right lobe living related liver transplantation can be performed safely for patients with GRWR >0,8 or 0,6 with Middle hepatic vein grafts. So, what was the GRWR? and indication for APOLDLT? 2. Encephalopathy grade of the patient and the normally range of the laboratory parameters should be noted. 3. MELD index should be corrected as MELD score 4. Surgical procedure: " The dilated donor right hepatic vein was end-to-side..." How did you dilated the right hepatic vein? did you mean using a vascular conduit? 5. "The recipient residual liver regenerated rapidly after operation and more than 90% of the necrotized hepatocytes regenerated within two weeks." Did you perform pre-Tx biopsy? 6. What was the explant pathology result? 7. Do you consider the remove back the transplanted partial liver graft to stop immunosuppression when the regeneration of the liver was completed? This manuscript is very poorly written and confusing. So it should be revised