

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20496

Title: Combination antiretroviral studies for patients with primary biliary cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 02860814

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-06-10 08:27

Date reviewed: 2015-07-09 19:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I read with great interest the paper by Lytvyak et al, regarding the use of anti-retroviral therapy for PBC patients. It is a very well written paper providing a detailed review and update information on the use of anti-retroviral drugs for UDCA non-responders PBC patients. It will be interesting for the reader to see results, regarding the detection of human betaretrovirus in normal subjects or subjects with other liver diseases apart from PBC. For example Xu et al (Hepatology 2014) failed to detect betaretrovirus nucleic acid sequences in six liver disease control patients at the time of liver transplantation in contrast to 2 out of 4 PBC patients. Moreover, Johal et al (J Hepatol 2009) could not identify MMTLV-LV envelope sequences in 20 patients with histologically normal liver tissue, but they did in 50/184 (27%) patients with other liver diseases such as viral hepatitis, alcoholic and non-alcoholic liver disease etc. Finally, Wang et al (Aliment Pharmacol Ther 2015) detect HBRV integrations in 7% and HBRV RNA in BEC lysates in 15% of "liver controls" (including AIH and cryptogenic liver disease). A discussion is needed about these discrepancies and what may be the potential impact of retroviruses in this set of patients without PBC. A minor comment: as Combivir, Kaletra and Truvada are the commercial names of the drugs, the symbol of trademark must be added.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20496

Title: Combination antiretroviral studies for patients with primary biliary cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 00050195

Reviewer's country: Israel

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-06-10 08:27

Date reviewed: 2015-06-19 19:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is extremely well written and is an excellent summary of the data implicating retroviruses in the development of and progression of PBC. . There are a few minor errors in syntax- in the core tip last sentence "The use of digital droplet PCR has markedly improved the sensitivity of viral detection in peripheral ? and should enable' Also HBRV interchanged with human betaretrovirus. It should be defined once and the the abbreviation used. Page 4 second sentence- poor construction