

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 19878

Title: Delayed diagnosis of alpha-1-antitrypsin deficiency following post-hepatectomy liver failure: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00069130

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-05-25 18:33

Date reviewed: 2015-06-21 01:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Sir, This is a well written and informative case report. a-antitrypsin deficiency is quite often not suspected in many parts of the world in a patient undergoing liver resection following liver cancer. Living donor liver transplantation is gaining unprecedented popularity all over the world and especially in Asian countries. a1-anti-trypsin mutation screening should be incorporated into the donor screening protocol for the safety of both the donor and the recipient. Authors may include this fact also in the discussion. The authors may include the details of the SNP/genetic screening done on this patient-the DNA sequence or RFLP gel picture. Anti-a1-ATT immunofluorescence staining of liver and lung tissue will show the denatured protein aggregates inside the cells. This will further confirm the diagnosis and would make this report more attractive and useful for the readers. The authors also may include some more details about a1-ATT deficiency, genotypes and phenotypes and its common clinical presentations. I recommend the publication of this case report in WJG. Your's truly, Sanal MG

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 19878

Title: Delayed diagnosis of alpha-1-antitrypsin deficiency following post-hepatectomy liver failure: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00058159

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-05-25 18:33

Date reviewed: 2015-07-21 13:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case report demonstrated a rare case of Alpha-1-antitrypsin deficiency (AATD) who died of posthepatectomy liver failure (DHLEF) after an extended right hepatectomy for metastatic colon cancer. This case is unique and worthwhile reporting provided some defects were corrected. The followings were considered as minor defects and needs to be corrected. 1. Liver failure is the most terrible event after liver resection, thus, the most important point is to avoid its occurrence. In general, Makuuchi criteria for cirrhotic liver resection was used worldwide. (Makuuchi M et al Semi Surg Oncol 1993). Therefore, in this case report, the authors should mention the detail which is important in occurrence of PHLEF. (1)Do you use ICG clearance test as a preoperative liver function evaluation? (2)Would you please provide the data of estimated blood loss, amount of blood transfusion in the operation, operative time, and duration of liver transection. What is the liver resection criteria in your department? (3)Do you use Pringle maneuver during liver transaction. If so, please tell us the total duration of Pringle clamping time. Moreover, how do you transect the liver? CUSA or Kelly-crushing method. (4) In the literatures, is there any report regarding a safe hepatectomy in AATD patients? If



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

a patient had AATD, is hepatectomy suitable or contraindicated for him? 2. In references section, the data of PMID is not required.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 19878

Title: Delayed diagnosis of alpha-1-antitrypsin deficiency following post-hepatectomy liver failure: A case report

Reviewer's code: 02989321

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-05-25 18:33

Date reviewed: 2015-07-22 02:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting case report, given that major hepatectomies are nowadays more frequently considered for a number of indications. Hence, guidance for preoperative assessment is a topical subject. The case report is well presented including all relevant details. It is advisable to : a) modify title so that it reflects this is a case-report article b) state relevant literature (postoperative liver failure due to undiagnosed AATP deficiency) c) suggest management modification in case condition is known/diagnosed preoperatively.