

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21291

Title: Transplantation of mesenchymal stem cells in combination with Interleukin-1 receptor antagonist, benefits liver regeneration post hepatectomy

Reviewer's code: 03257477

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-07-06 13:03

Date reviewed: 2015-07-27 09:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper provide additional information about possible therapies to treat acute liver failure. Using a swine model, authors demonstrated that blocking of IL-1 improve parameters such as liver function, inflammation, proliferation and apoptosis, that previously were described by others that used only MST therapy. I suggest minor revisions that may improve the manuscript. Spell checking is recommended Review the cite 13, that does not correspond to the cited information. Correct the word "stimulation" in page 4. Correct "flowcitometry", "indicatng" in section Results. Serum levels of ALT and AST were significantly elevated within 1-7 days after hepatectomy, although progressively only of ALT. Correct in section Results. Serum levels of hepatic enzymes were measured 1, 3, 5 days and 1-2 weeks after surgery, not 1-3 weeks. Panels in some figures are missing: figure 1, figure2, panel F is missing in figure 8 Scale bars in histological analysis are not clear in figure 6. In figure 6, sinus silation means sinus dilation? Take in consideration the sequence of the events that happen in inflammatory processes. At the beginning, it is so important the first immune response in order to repair mechanisms following trauma and to content the disorganized proliferation. As well,



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

cytokines are involved in wound healing and post-traumatic pain. Then, the time window is crucial in different steps of the recovery process. Speculate about the time of administration of IL-1Ra regarding to the injection of mesenchymal cells and to block complete or partially the effect of IL-1. It is suggested further information regarding ILRa secreted by mesenchymal stem cells. Recommended bibliography: Meier, et al. 2015. Journal of hepatology. Microencapsulated human mesenchymal stem cells decrease liver fibrosis in mice.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21291

Title: Transplantation of mesenchymal stem cells in combination with Interleukin-1 receptor antagonist, benefits liver regeneration post hepatectomy

Reviewer's code: 02817470

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-07-06 13:03

Date reviewed: 2015-07-14 22:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper presents a novel therapy method for ALF. The main problem with the paper is that it is very poorly written; Most sentences contain grammatical and/or spelling mistakes or are not complete sentences. The authors must have their work reviewed by a proper translation/reviewing service before submission

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21291

Title: Transplantation of mesenchymal stem cells in combination with Interleukin-1 receptor antagonist, benefits liver regeneration post hepatectomy

Reviewer's code: 02861333

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-07-06 13:03

Date reviewed: 2015-07-15 23:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study provided a new way to restore or treat ALF. The result of the study showed the combination therapies of MSC with IL-1Ra can increase the liver regeneration post hepatectomy in the Chinese swine model. The study appears promising and provides the preclinical application of MSC. However, the manuscript is not written smoothly. Many errors need to be corrected.