

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23815

Title: Total pancreatectomy with islet cell transplantation vs intrathecal narcotic pump infusion for pain control in chronic pancreatitis

Reviewer's code: 00039529

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-12-20 18:10

Date reviewed: 2015-12-21 00:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Excellent study, particularly given the limitations of patient availability. Well written and analyzed. This is a potentially important message, and your follow-up should continue.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23815

Title: Total pancreatectomy with islet cell transplantation vs intrathecal narcotic pump infusion for pain control in chronic pancreatitis

Reviewer's code: 00043819

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-12-20 18:10

Date reviewed: 2015-12-24 17:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Very interesting paper and topic. The main limitation is the retrospective nature of the study, the small number of patients enrolled in the ITNP Group, the short follow-up. Moreover, data were collected from different hospitals, so the indication for surgery or ITNP is not clear. Since ITNP was performed only in one Institute, it is difficult to compare results.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23815

Title: Total pancreatectomy with islet cell transplantation vs intrathecal narcotic pump infusion for pain control in chronic pancreatitis

Reviewer's code: 00058446

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-12-20 18:10

Date reviewed: 2015-12-27 09:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a retrospective study of Total Pancreatectomy (TP) + Islet Cell Transplantation (ICT) and Intrathecal Narcotic Pump infusion (ITNP) for the control of intractable pain in chronic pancreatitis (CP). The aim is to evaluate pain control in patients with CP from a single center. ITNP and TP+ICT are comparable for pain control in patients with CP, however with high incidence of DM among TP+ICT group. And prospective comparative studies and longer follow up are needed to define the treatment outcomes. 1.What is the indication for Total Pancreatectomy (TP) + Islet Cell Transplantation (ICT) or Intrathecal Narcotic Pump infusion (ITNP)? 2.Does the patient have high pancreatic duct pressure or pancreatic duct dilatation ? 3.Does the patients need immunosuppressive therapy after TP +ICT?