BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 24670
Title: Serum Mac-2 binding protein is a novel biomarker for chronic pancreatitis
Reviewer's code: 00069230
Reviewer's country: United States
Science editor: Jing Yu
Date sent for review: 2016-01-31 17:31
Date reviewed: 2016-02-12 08:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

"Serum Mac-2 binding protein is a novel biomarker for chronic pancreatitis" is a well written interesting manuscript. There are three concerns which require to be addressed by the authors. 1- In the Discussion, lines 257-258, "Our results indicate that increased serum Mac-2bp in subjects without liver diseases should be evaluated for subclinical CP." If detection of high serum levels of Mac-2bp is a consequence of and/or requires liver inflammation (Table 2 and Figure 3), why do the authors make emphasis on 'subjects without liver diseases'? How do the authors rule out a liver disease in this study? 2- Figure 3 (Putative mechanism of serum Mac-2bp changes in chronic pancreatitis and pancreatic ductal adenocarcinoma) shows a decrease in liver inflammation in patients with PDAC. However, according to Table 1 (Clinical and serological characteristics of the subjects in this study), there are no significant differences for markers of liver inflammation (i.e. AST and ALT) between CP and PDAC patients. How can this be conciliated? 3- In the present manuscript the authors conclude that serum Mac-2bp may be a novel and useful biomarker for subclinical CP diagnosis, however Mac-2bp is also reported to be increased in breast cancer, lung cancer, colorectal cancer, and prostate cancer. Can the authors further expand on the analytical performance validation process for Mac-2bp

by looking into its sensitivity, specificity, robustness, accuracy and reproducibility?

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 24670
Title: Serum Mac-2 binding protein is a novel biomarker for chronic pancreatitis
Reviewer's code: 02445658
Reviewer's country: India
Science editor: Jing Yu
Date sent for review: 2016-01-31 17:31
Date reviewed: 2016-02-12 12:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Definition of Sublinical CP needs to mentioned Your subjects are divided into HV, CP and PDAC , but your conclusions suggest using this in subclinical CP . Is there a distinction in the subclincal and CP group ? How do you identify and define this should be clear in Methods and study design You should try to give more nformation in Subgroups who had CP and PDAC , whether how many had co-existing NASH using Mac2bp levels . Also how did you define HV ? is it by absence of CP /NASH or both

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 24670
Title: Serum Mac-2 binding protein is a novel biomarker for chronic pancreatitis
Reviewer's code: 03479389
Reviewer's country: Japan
Science editor: Jing Yu
Date sent for review: 2016-01-31 17:31
Date reviewed: 2016-02-24 23:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article described the usefulness of the measurement of serum Mac-2bp for subclinical CP diagnosis. My comment is as follows. 1.There is no mention of the study period. 2.Please describe a sample size to be required for this study. 3.The etiology of CP patients in this study is unknown. How many alcohol CP patients are there? 4.You reported the association between Mac-2bp level and NASH patients. Which of alcohol or over-nutrition is the Mac-2bp level of CP patients associated with? 5.Does the Mac-2bp level have a difference between asymptomatic CP patients and symptomatic CP patients? 6.Do PDAC patients in this study include patients derived from CP? If included, does the Mac-2bp level have a difference between PDAC patients derived from CP and other PDAC patients?

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 24670
Title: Serum Mac-2 binding protein is a novel biomarker for chronic pancreatitis
Reviewer's code: 01804189
Reviewer's country: India
Science editor: Jing Yu
Date sent for review: 2016-01-31 17:31
Date reviewed: 2016-02-29 00:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[Y] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[Y] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[Y] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Mac-2bp is produced in liver due to hepatic inflamation of varied etiologies and is not specifically produced in pancreas. 2. In view of wide prevalence of hepatic steatosis and steatohepatitis, it is unlikely to find a patient only with chronic pancreatitis and absolutely normal liver. 3. Alcohol being the most common etiology of chronic pancreatitis, it is highly unlikely that the liver is normal in such patients. 4. There is no attempt in the study to exclude any form of liver disease in patients with chronic pancreatitis. 5. Most patients with pancreatic adenocarcinoma have underlying chronic pancreatitis, so discrimination based on Mac-2bp is difficult. 6. At this stage it is difficult to propose Mac-2bp as a test for screening of chronic pancreatitis because of high incidence of liver disorders in such patients.