

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24986

Title: Liver Transplantation: Current Status and Challenges

Reviewer's code: 00053888

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-02-18 11:51

Date reviewed: 2016-02-22 21:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written overview of some of the current difficult areas in liver transplantation. The manuscript covers very broad ranging topics but not is any detail. My only criticism is that this manuscript covers too broad an area and might be better concentrating on either organ donation or immunosuppression on the basis that they are very distinct areas. Having said that the manuscript makes fairly light reading. Is liver transplantation really 'accepted as the only treatment option for cholangiocarcinoma'? If this is the case at the Mayo it certainly is not across the rest of the World!

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24986

Title: Liver Transplantation: Current Status and Challenges

Reviewer's code: 00053950

Reviewer's country: Finland

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-02-18 11:51

Date reviewed: 2016-03-05 20:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is a well written and interesting review about challenges and modern ways to solve them. Remarks: - Using of DCD donors could increase the organ donor pool markedly. However, in countries, in which the program is widely adopted, the amount of brain death donors has decreased. The explanation may be decreasing interest in identification of brain dead donors as DCD program is functioning. It would be utmost important that both the programs would be as active as possible. - As the authors point out the machine perfusion of the organs after the retrieval is by no means a new innovation. Earlier the kidney perfusion machines were robust and unpractical. Modern versions, however, are handy, but require quite much additional effort during preservation and are expensive. How perfusion will improve the quality of liver grafts is a matter of the future. Nevertheless, the paper gives a good introduction to this field. - Renal sparing protocols is nothing new, but always an important issue. mTOR inhibitors have been rather disappointing when used in this indication. They are rather poorly tolerated and sirolimus pneumonitis may even be life-threatening. To have a marked influence on the kidney function the mTOR inhibitors should be started as early as possible, which is inconvenient in many ways. - Delayed introduction of CNI inhibitors has been an alternative for a



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

long time. Of IL2R antibodies only basiliximab is nowadays available. It apparently is effective in postponing the introduction of CNI inhibitors but it is expensive in a routine use. - The significance of circulating DSAs has well been shown in the renal transplantation, but some evidence exists that it might have some influence on the chronic rejection of the liver graft as well.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24986

Title: Liver Transplantation: Current Status and Challenges

Reviewer's code: 02438659

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-02-18 11:51

Date reviewed: 2016-03-06 22:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Organ shortage remains a major limitation in LT, and there has been a significant effort over the past decade to increase the existing deceased donor pool. These advances have allowed for expansion of the donor pool with concurrent improved patient outcomes. It is a well-written and organized paper.