

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23607

Title: Role of estrogen receptor β selective agonist in ameliorating portal hypertension in rats with CCl₄-induced liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 02860895

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-12-29 14:24

Date reviewed: 2016-01-11 21:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a fine experimental study concerning efficacy of ER agonist against cirrhosis-related portal hypertension. I congratulate the authors of this excellent work. However, I have one concern in the morphometric analysis. Their theoretical basis consists of the decline of activated HSCs by ER agonist. Figure 2 shows the comparative method of SMA-positive cell amounts. Importantly, Figure 2a demonstrates that SMA-positive cells in this investigation are mostly vascular smooth muscle cells. Hence, the data don't reflect changing of the number of activated HSCs. The authors should have done a more specific analysis for activated HSCs. The methodology should be reconsidered.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23607

Title: Role of estrogen receptor β selective agonist in ameliorating portal hypertension in rats with CCl₄-induced liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 01488602

Reviewer's country: Romania

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-12-29 14:24

Date reviewed: 2016-01-19 05:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well done experimental study. Practical benefits from this study in clinical practice will not occur too soon. But being done, the study should be published and know. The authors should discuss the hyperestrogenism observed sometimes in cirrhosis in the context of the therapeutic potential of estrogen in therapy of fibrosis. Given the authors result, the inactivation of estrogen encountered in cirrhosis should have a favorable effect for the progression of disease. Authors should comment this issue. Many language errors and typos.