

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23576

Title: Methylation of DAPK and THBS1 genes in esophageal gastric-type columnar metaplasia

Reviewer's code: 03086186

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-12-04 09:51

Date reviewed: 2015-12-06 10:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Herrera-Goepfert R et al. explored gene methylation in esophageal columnar metaplasia, and correlated these findings with the status of H. pylori cagA+. It is well written and contains information which readers may be interested. Because it is suggested that intestinal metaplasia in the esophagus arises from gastric-type metaplasia, I suggest authors to include intestinal metaplasia in the study.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23576

Title: Methylation of DAPK and THBS1 genes in esophageal gastric-type columnar metaplasia

Reviewer's code: 00057996

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-12-04 09:51

Date reviewed: 2015-12-23 04:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Herrera-Goepfert and colleagues presented in their manuscript "Methylation of DAPK and THBS1 genes in esophageal gastric-type columnar metaplasia" data on a potential influence of HP infection on methylation of relevant tumor suppressor genes in gastric-type columnar metaplasia. In summary, the study presents some interesting findings, and the manuscript is well written. I have only a few comments for the authors: 1) The result section in abstract does not provide any data on methylation status of investigated genes. 2) The numbering of tables seems incorrect. The results state for example "Histopathological variables according to the Updated Sydney System for the classification and grading of gastritis were significantly associated with H. pylori cagA+ status (Table 5).", but table 5 shows "Association of Helicobacter pylori cagA+ infection as detected by PCR with DNA methylation of the promoter regions of target genes in 33 esophageal and gastric biopsies." 3) The authors should add clinical data on severity or symptoms of reflux, extent of metaplasia etc. In addition, I would ask the authors to provide more detailed information on the indication of endoscopy and biopsy as this might bias results. 4) The low number and especially missing samples



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

of the gastric samples (there is no reason given why some patients have gastric biopsies and why others have not) makes interpretation of these data extremely difficult. The authors should acknowledge this in more detail. 5) Inclusion of intestinal metaplasia and comparison between specialized and non-specialized columnar metaplasia if possible would be very interesting. If not available, authors should comment on this.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23576

Title: Methylation of DAPK and THBS1 genes in esophageal gastric-type columnar metaplasia

Reviewer's code: 02537190

Reviewer's country: Slovenia

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-12-04 09:51

Date reviewed: 2015-12-28 04:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the manuscript Methylation of DAPK and THBS1 genes in esophageal gastric- type columnar metaplasia by Herrera-Goepfert R et al. authors are trying to analyse the influence of H pylori infection on the methylation of some genes that can influence the risk of esophageal cancer. This idea is clinically relevant, but authors should be well aware of some limitations of their retrospective observative nature of their study. The risk of sampling bias on their results should be clearly acknowledged in the manuscript. In that way conclusions of this study can serve as a good idea for a prospective study with well defined biopsy protocol. An important message of this study is that cag A H pylori infection in GERD patients is not protective and it can even have some harmful consequences to the gastric metaplastic mucosa in esophagus. All patients with GERD and metaplastic esophageal mucosa infected with H pylori should be eradicated. This could also be one of conclusions of this study.