

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24182

Title: Lymph node dissection result of minimally invasive esophagectomy compared with open surgery for esophageal squamous cell carcinoma: a retrospective controlled/comparative study

Reviewer's code: 02857161

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2016-01-12 10:36

Date reviewed: 2016-02-01 08:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting manuscript about the minimally invasive esophagectomy compared with open surgery for esophageal squamous cell carcinoma. In this manuscript, the lymph node dissection result of minimally invasive esophagectomy and open surgery for esophageal squamous cell carcinoma were compared. Data from patients who underwent MIE or open surgery for esophageal squamous cell carcinoma were reviewed. The authors found that the LNS rate at left para-recurrent laryngeal nerve site was significantly higher for open surgery than for MIE, but no differences at other sites. The LNM rate at left para-RLN site in open surgery group was significantly higher than that in MIE group, regardless of pathologic T stage. Over all, the study is well designed and the manuscript is well written. Some minor revisions needed. 1 The results are interesting, but if the authors can add some figures, it will be more interesting. 2 There are some minor language polishing should be corrected. 3 References should be updated. More recent references should be added and discussed.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24182

Title: Lymph node dissection result of minimally invasive esophagectomy compared with open surgery for esophageal squamous cell carcinoma: a retrospective controlled/comparative study

Reviewer's code: 03026093

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2016-01-12 10:36

Date reviewed: 2016-02-03 09:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an very interesting manuscript. After some minor revision of the language, this manuscript can be accepted.