

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24673

**Title:** Effects of sphincter of Oddi motility on the formation of cholesterol gallstones

**Reviewer's code:** 03253499

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2016-02-01 10:36

**Date reviewed:** 2016-02-02 20:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors describes the results of a basic study in a guinea pig model to investigate the role of SO motility in cholesterol gallbladder stone formation in a guinea pig model. They divided animals into two groups, one was fed with a normal diet and the other fed with a cholesterol lithogenic diet. They concluded that a cholesterol gallstone-causing diet may induce an increasing tension and a decreasing activity of SO and this could play an important role in cholesterol gallstone formation. This represent a well-conducted basic study that add useful information about the role of SO motility in the process of cholesterol gallstone formation and confirm previous limited data that indicated a significant increase in the base pressure of the SO in rabbits with a cholesterol lithogenic diet. Minor comment: - Editing of the references list must be done carefully.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24673

**Title:** Effects of sphincter of Oddi motility on the formation of cholesterol gallstones

**Reviewer's code:** 00057951

**Reviewer's country:** Chile

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2016-02-01 10:36

**Date reviewed:** 2016-02-09 19:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [ Y] Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [ Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [ Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations on your fine work.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24673

**Title:** Effects of sphincter of Oddi motility on the formation of cholesterol gallstones

**Reviewer's code:** 00507108

**Reviewer's country:** Israel

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2016-02-01 10:36

**Date reviewed:** 2016-02-24 21:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[ Y ] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[ Y ] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting paper. The authors have previously described a guinea pig model of pigment stone formation and found that the diet caused Sphincter of Oddi dysfunction. This paper finds similar results in a cholesterol fed model producing cholesterol stones. The Authors might insert a paragraph comparing and contrasting the 2 models of gall stones. Is the sphincter disturbance related to the physical presence of stones rather than their composition? The introduction and methods section is clear and easy to read. The results section should include the 3 6 9 and 12 week results, with so few animals and so many analyses it would be helpful to see trends. For example the Sphincter and CBD pressures are very impressive but the amplitude and frequency SO manometry not matching and myoelectric frequency also surprising? The 3 and 6 week levels would be helpful as can be seen in the Table 4.. Is a p value of 0.05 reasonable with so many tests? Should  $p < 0.01$  be used as significance? The increase in CCK-AR is of great interest but no discussion as to why CCK-8 was not increased. The authors should consider discussing the relationship between fasting and postprandial, when the gall bladder becomes active to release bile into the intestine. High cholesterol diets increase bile synthesis. Would the Authors consider discussing the role of bile



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

volume as the cause of the increase in pressure in the gall bladder and CBD.? Is it the increase in bile volume that disturbs the sphincter? A very interesting study, I do hope the Authors will consider the implications of the very similar findings to their previous pigment stone paper.