

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25477

Title: Comprehensive Risk Assessment for Early Neurologic Complications After Liver Transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00504828

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-03-11 14:57

Date reviewed: 2016-03-27 05:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This retrospective study describes neurological complications (NCs) after liver transplantation at a single medical center in Taiwan. Core tip is concise but well-written and helped grab the message of this manuscript. In addition, the details related to clinical study design is meticulously well prepared - I think others should take a look on this paper as a great example. Major comments none Minor comments 1. Table 3 - what would be a potential factor(s) linking NC and significantly higher risk of alcoholic liver diseases? It looks to me that this is particularly something important to investigate. Although such investigation will be beyond the aim and scope of this study, it would be great if the authors can lightly develop a few sentence of discussion. If any previous published studies suggested such a link, I would definitely cite such papers to discuss. 2. Page 5, lines 15~16 "In the last decade, the risk factors...most of which were retrospective." Appropriate literatures should be cited. 3. Very minor formatting issue. I guess that Page 6, "patients and methods" should begin from a new page (page break). Please check the instruction of the journal.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25477

Title: Comprehensive Risk Assessment for Early Neurologic Complications After Liver Transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00504647

Reviewer's country: Poland

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-03-11 14:57

Date reviewed: 2016-03-30 03:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is well written case-control study, describing single-center experience with neurological complications after liver transplantation. Methodology is very well described and statistical analyses advanced. One weakness of this study, which obviously can not be corrected, is that diagnoses of neurological complications were not done by independent observer (preferably neurologist).