



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24769

Title: Hepatitis E in Israel: A nation-wide retrospective study

Reviewer's code: 00225318

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-02-09 14:42

Date reviewed: 2016-03-31 17:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript: Hepatitis E in Israel: A nation-wide retrospective study Running Title. Hepatitis E in Israel "Ortal Erez-Granat et al represents an interesting study of the etiology of acute hepatitis HEV in Israel reporting well documented data of interest to the scientific community. However, this study presents some limitations, that the authors themselves recognize. specially, the inability to develop phylogenetic studies in ancient autoctonous cases by poor maintenance of serum samples. This reviewer assumed this difficulty as insuperable and understands the authors have been able to properly classify the most recent cases, which have proved genotype 1 and this data is interesting. However the study has some additional limitations that must be resolved, especially an methodological level. 1.-The sensitivity and specificity of serologic techniques wich have been used are reported in base to the data directly obtained from reagents providers, which is completely insufficient. The authors must provide this data from the comparison of these DS-EIA-anti-HEV-G, DSEIA-anti-HEV-M, DSI S.R.L. Serronno (VA) with other available methodology such as Wantai and Microgen. 2-Indicate the sensitivity of detection of HEV RNA. 3-The data about pregant women are specially rellevant. In this regard. the authors should provide more information about the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

subsequent evolution of these patients and their children. Especially in the two fulminant cases which fortunately were not fatal. It does not seem right that these data be reported in a further, as the authors indicate. If at the time of the present study these data are available, the authors should included them in this manuscript.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 24769

Title: Hepatitis E in Israel: A nation-wide retrospective study

Reviewer's code: 03538269

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-02-09 14:42

Date reviewed: 2016-02-18 14:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Nicely written article.