

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26215

Title: Silybin counteracts lipid excess and oxidative stress in cultured steatotic hepatic cells

Reviewer's code: 02527608

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-05 17:27

Date reviewed: 2016-04-08 08:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscripts by Vecchione and colleagues describes that Silybin counteracts lipid excess and oxidative stress in cultured steatotic hepatic cell. 1. This work presented interesting finding on the anti-oxidant effect of silybin, however, they used hepatome FaO cell as model to monitor, how about normal hepatocyte? 2. In Figure 2A, PPAR mRNA show different expression, how about protein level for PPAR? 3. Can they show silybin alone in FaO cell viability?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26215

Title: Silybin counteracts lipid excess and oxidative stress in cultured steatotic hepatic cells

Reviewer's code: 02958262

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-05 17:27

Date reviewed: 2016-04-13 22:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors propose to clarify whether silybin as phytosome complex with vitamin E may favorably affect lipid and radical homeostasis using an in vitro model of NAFLD induced by the exposure of hepatoma FaO cells to exogenous FAs. The problem and objective of the manuscript are appropriated. However, some minor points must to be clarified. The specific issues are outlined below. Comments

1. Introduction is too long and silybin have presented to the reader in the very end of the introduction. Introduction must be rewritten to better demonstrates the possible interaction between silybin in NASH
2. The anti-steatotic effect of silybin is well demonstrated in the results. However, the mechanistic interaction between o silybin, oxidative stress and FA metabolism is presented in the speculative level. It is particularly important because of the justification of the authors in the introduction "the molecular mechanisms associated with the hepatoprotective activity of silybin remain to be elucidated". Down-regulated oxidative stress promoted by silybin can signal to FA catabolism? Please include studies and/or experiments demonstrating oxidative stress may modulate PPARs. Up-regulation of PPAR α and down-regulation of PPAR? mRNA levels promoted by silybin



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

treatment, only suggests that silybin is associated with a stimulation of mitochondrial oxidation. Please, provide studies and/or experiments demonstrating oxidative Up-regulation of PPAR α and down-regulation of PPAR γ mRNA are related to increased oxygen consumption and of mitochondrial oxidation.