

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25844

**Title:** Role of NK, NKT cells and macrophages in liver transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 01559615

**Reviewer's country:** Turkey

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-24 17:42

**Date reviewed:** 2016-04-11 18:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors are reviewed hepatic natural killer (NK), NKT and Kupffer cells and their role in the mechanism of liver transplant rejection, tolerance and hepatic ischemia-reperfusion injury. This is a well-designed review regarding to the topic. To better understand the relation of IR injury of the liver and transplantation of the liver, this manuscript present and analysis important data of current literature. However, I would like to ask some questions to authors. First, hepatic injury secondary to cold organ storage or preservation is one of the major factors in graft survival after liver transplantation. I would like to see improving this manuscript in the aspect of organ preservation injury. Second, related to my first comment, IR injury of the liver is divided in to two sections in liver transplantation; cold IR injury and warm IR injury. Most studies on the field focused on warm IR injury. This imbalance may be related to feasibility of warm IR models compared to cold ones. In addition, the current advancement of liver surgery is directly based on well-understanding of warm IR injury of the liver. However, differences between cold and warm IR injury of the liver should be mentioned in the manuscript. Third, in the "mechanisms of hepatic ischemia-reperfusion injury" part of manuscript, authors are described hepatic IR injury with this sentence "The hepatic



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

ischemia-reperfusion injury is associated with an inflammatory response leading to liver tissue necrosis and release of reactive oxygen species (ROS), induction of adhesion molecules, cytokine secretion and activation of leukocytes". Regarding to the current literature, necrosis has not been considered to the sole cell death mechanism in liver IR injury. Despite the efforts of authors regarding the description of apoptotic cell death in liver IR injury in the following pages in manuscript, this sentence should be revised. Figures of the manuscript are very poor. Figure-1 is in elaborately prepared. I can't reach a perspective on the issue in the help of this figure. This should be revised. The necessity of histopathological figure (figure-2) in this manuscript is bizarre. This figure is not including data regarding to "release of danger signals activating innate immune cells by TLR4, RAGE and TLR9 on Kupffer cells and neutrophils and CD4 Th1 effector T cells by the CD154-CD40 pathway". If authors would like to enrich manuscript with histopathological figures, these figures should be included early and late period of warm and cold (preservation) liver injury, acute rejection or chronic rejection after liver transplantation and electron microscope images of Kupffer cells.