



**ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 26275

**Title:** Serum metabolome profiles characterized by patients with hepatocellular carcinoma associated with hepatitis B and C

**Reviewer’s code:** 00052339

**Reviewer’s country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2016-04-07 12:56

**Date reviewed:** 2016-04-20 10:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Serum metabolome profiles characterized by patients with hepatocellular carcinoma associated with hepatitis B and C Saito T et al. This manuscript gives us the novel information on the serum metabolites in HCC patients. The author can address on the following points; #1 The stage of HCC including number and its size may affect the concentration and variation of metabolites in patient’s serum. Hence, we need the information of difference in the number and size of HCC between HCC-B and HCC-C. I think the same stage of HCC is necessary to compare the difference of metabolites directly or indirectly produced by HCC. #2 The contents of serum in HCC patients may be affected by the non-cancerous region such as liver cirrhosis because of production of many proteins by hepatocytes. In addition, the degree of inflammation of liver by HBV or HCV may trigger the production of many cytokines etc., so the author should describe the estimation of inflammatory or fibrotic stage of non-cancerous region. #3 In cluster X specific for HCC-B, why is this profile so specific for HCC-B? Is the stage of HCC-B or the degree of inflammation and fibrosis so focused or may HBV stimulate the production of serum metabolites? The HBV-DNA level may be lower or



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

different in each patients, thus how HBV contributes the focused cluster-X? #4 The cluster-Y is so wide range, is it possible to divide the cluster-Y to subgroup? #5 Is it possible that the heat map is reconstructed by the level of HBV-DNA or the degree of inflammation or fibrosis in the non-cancerous region?



**ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 26275

**Title:** Serum metabolome profiles characterized by patients with hepatocellular carcinoma associated with hepatitis B and C

**Reviewer’s code:** 00013203

**Reviewer’s country:** Mexico

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2016-04-07 12:56

**Date reviewed:** 2016-04-24 04:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Serum metabolome profiles characterized by patients with hepatocellular carcinoma associated with hepatitis B and C This is an interesting study. These researches tried to investigate the serum metabolome profiles of patients with hepatocellular carcinoma associated with hepatitis B and C. Unfortunately the population clinical and biochemical characteristics are incomplete. Comments: Page 6-11. Materials & Methods. What about of anthropometric variables and comorbidities such as type 2 diabetes, etc? Page 6-11. Materials & Methods. What about the written consent of each participant? And the approval of ethics committee? Page 6-11. Materials & Methods. The analytical methods sections is too long. I suggest to include a brief section Page 14. Discussion section. I suggest to include the limitations of this study Page 14. Conclusion section. I suggest to rewrite it accordingly with your results. Page 29. Table 1. What about the albumin, bilirubin, alkaline phosphatase, GGT, platelets and creatinine levels?