

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25236

Title: Microbiota-based treatments in alcoholic liver disease

Reviewer's code: 03538935

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-03-02 15:15

Date reviewed: 2016-03-30 20:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review is well written and the topic is interesting. I have two considerations and suggestions to add information to the reader. 1- Describe the average amount of alcohol intake and time in the cited studies, which changes were related to enteric flora, if it is the same as described for increased risk of developing chronic liver disease either the quantity and time are larger or smaller. 2. Add a table of the suggested therapies and studies cited for each, with potential benefits demonstrated, so it is more illustrative to readers.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25236

Title: Microbiota-based treatments in alcoholic liver disease

Reviewer's code: 00073425

Reviewer's country: Poland

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-03-02 15:15

Date reviewed: 2016-04-15 06:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper tries to present the role of microbiota-based treatments in alcoholic liver disease. The topic is interesting, in particular that, the management in ALD is difficult and without clear rules. The Authors describe the results of many studies, where effectiveness of probiotics, prebiotics and antibiotics in ALD is evaluated. The presented paper contains a lot of new information and is a significant contribution to the current medical knowledge. I have the following comment: (1) The Authors shall distinguish the different stages of ALD and in this context they should present the role of microbiota-based treatments. (2) The Authors shall clarify whether the amount of alcohol used has an impact on the effectiveness of treatment with these substances.