

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26063

Title: Hepatitis-Related Hepatocellular Carcinoma: Insights into Cytokine Gene Polymorphisms

Reviewer's code: 00071472

Reviewer's country: Indonesia

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-03-31 08:54

Date reviewed: 2016-04-08 14:50

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is good and comprehensive review about Cytokine gene polymorphism in hepatitis-related HCC. The manuscript is well organized and well constructed. However, in Table 1, as summary of the review, the authors should add one more column about correlation of respective gene polymorphism and HCC. If the correlation is still not clear, the authors can state "no clear correlation". In addition, the English in this manuscript should be improved.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26063

Title: Hepatitis-Related Hepatocellular Carcinoma: Insights into Cytokine Gene Polymorphisms

Reviewer's code: 03478198

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-03-31 08:54

Date reviewed: 2016-04-18 04:37

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors comprehensively reviewed the molecular epidemiological association between HCC risks and genetic polymorphisms on the cytokine genes. In general, this review included the most important studies published in the last two decades and summarized these studies by genes and risks. The credit of doing such a large amount of work by authors should be given and appreciated; however, several concerns need to be addressed. 1. The authors only listed and simply stated the results (risks or protective effects of polymorphisms) from many studies, but they did not dig into the reasons for those contrary findings. To review molecular epidemiology studies (using genetic variants as markers), authors should analyze confounding factors, such as the sample size, the ethnicity of the study population, the disease stage, and the genotyping method, etc. I suggest authors re-visit the publications and summarize/explain above factors in the revised manuscript. 2. There are many grammatical errors and typos in the manuscript, for which authors should correct and improve. 3. Authors believed that the expression of cytokines has an important effect on the HCC incidence; therefore, the association between the copy number variation of cytokine genes and



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

HCC risk should be mentioned/reviewed in the manuscript. 4. Table I is not informative enough. Author should include the odd ratio and confidence interval for each study to clearly demonstrate the risk or protective effect. 5. In some places, the style for presenting SNP is not appropriate. For example, IL-1 β -31 should be IL-1 β -31C or IL-1 β -31T.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26063

Title: Hepatitis-Related Hepatocellular Carcinoma: Insights into Cytokine Gene Polymorphisms

Reviewer's code: 02786804

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-03-31 08:54

Date reviewed: 2016-04-20 18:17

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dondeti MF et al. read many relevant references about the association of cytokine gene polymorphisms with hepatitis-related hepatocellular carcinoma, and give us a comprehensive review for the achievements of this field. The title is interesting enough to attract reader's attentions. Major issues: (1) Authors should add introduction part in the beginning and summary at the end of the manuscript. (2) The English language needs to be carefully checked and edited, there are many mistakes in grammar, sentence structure, and word spelling. (3) Try to make the content more concise and clear.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26063

Title: Hepatitis-Related Hepatocellular Carcinoma: Insights into Cytokine Gene Polymorphisms

Reviewer's code: 02624733

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-03-31 08:54

Date reviewed: 2016-04-26 22:43

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

? The data under title: Roles of cytokines in the hepatitis viruses infections is not mentioned the role of cytokines in HCV in details. It showed only some basic data. I suggest rewriting this part. ? The data under the title: Cytokines' gene polymorphisms as the protagonist of hepatitis-related HCC is also basic information, could you delete the paragraphs about the definition and types of the polymorphisms. ? When the authors studied the individual cytokines with HCC, I think they should study more meta analyses studies than case controls' and discuss them in details. ? Rewrite the title of table 1 to become meaningful ? Figure 1 should be uploaded again as it is not obvious.