

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23721

Title: Combined radiologic and endoscopic treatment (using the “rendezvous technique”) of a biliary fistula following left hepatectomy

Reviewer’s code: 00071753

Reviewer’s country: Brazil

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-12-19 18:52

Date reviewed: 2015-12-21 00:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Concerns: 1- The introduction of the manuscript is a copy of the Abstract. 2- The author did not show where the position of the tumor in the duodenum was and what kind of resection was performed (Duodenal segment resection and anastomosis?). 3- How the drainage of the biliary fistula was performed through an old drainage orifice? 4- The incidence of biliary fistulas after hepatectomy in the introduction and discussion has two different percentage rates. 5- Why trisegmentectomy was not an option after the per-operative discovery of the anatomic variation? It could be oncologically safer and avoid this costly biliary complication. 6- There are grammar and syntax errors in the manuscript.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23721

Title: Combined radiologic and endoscopic treatment (using the “rendezvous technique”) of a biliary fistula following left hepatectomy

Reviewer’s code: 00068443

Reviewer’s country: China

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-12-19 18:52

Date reviewed: 2015-12-30 14:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, authors reported a case of combined radiologic and endoscopic procedure to treat biliary fistula in a patient with anatomical variation of intrahepatic bile duct after hepatectomy. Although the manuscript is interesting, there are some concerns that need to be addressed. 1. How to reconstruct the gastro-intestinal continuity after resection of the duodenal gastrinoma? 2. The contexts of abstract and introduction are similar. 3. many typo and grammar errors.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23721

Title: Combined radiologic and endoscopic treatment (using the "rendezvous technique") of a biliary fistula following left hepatectomy

Reviewer's code: 02549799

Reviewer's country: Australia

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-12-19 18:52

Date reviewed: 2015-12-31 00:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for submitting this article for review. This is a well written, concise and elegant description of a new technique for management of complications. The intra-operative images are of excellent quality. I have a couple of comments. I think additional detail with respect to operative technique would be illuminating. I would like to know where the ducts were taken at the time of surgery and more detail as to why hepatico jejunostomy was not performed. I also think that expert readers would be interested in more detail with regards to the "rendezvous" procedure. Finally there are a few minor grammatical errors which should be addressed. Very nice article.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23721

Title: Combined radiologic and endoscopic treatment (using the “rendezvous technique”) of a biliary fistula following left hepatectomy

Reviewer’s code: 00069130

Reviewer’s country: United States

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-12-19 18:52

Date reviewed: 2016-01-05 12:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Gracient A et al. titled ‘Combined radiologic and endoscopic treatment (using the “rendezvous technique”) of a biliary fistula following left hepatectomy’ is a case report where they report their experience with a patient who underwent partial hepatectomy for gastrinoma metastasis to his liver. The patient had an anatomical variation- the right posterior segmental duct (RPSD) joined the left hepatic duct (LHD). The authors report on the use of a combined radiologic and endoscopic procedure (based on the “rendezvous technique”), to treat biliary fistula following left hepatectomy, in this patient. This is a well written manuscript. The language use, grammar, is by and large good. In page 4, line 5 under subtitle ‘case’ the sentence may need some revision. A question we have in mind. Whether the authors used intra-operatively, some dye like the blue dye (methylene blue) to see if there is any leak in the bile duct. If they used what was the result? This manuscript would be useful for surgeons, general surgeons, interventional radiologists and gastroenterologists who have an interest in surgical procedures. We recommend this manuscript for the favour of publication in W.J.G. Murali