BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 27286
Title: Pretreatment AKR1B10 expression predicts the risk of HCC development after HCV eradication
Reviewer's code: 00058381
Reviewer's country: Austria
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2016-05-23 11:32
Date reviewed: 2016-05-28 03:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major Comment: This is an interesting evaluation of pretreatment AKR1B10 expression and risk of HCC development after HCV eradication. It has, of course, the drawbacks of retrospective monocenter studies but it may be seen as an incentive for further investigations. Minor Comments: Page 12, first paragraph: "153 patients (50.5%) presented scarce AKR1B10 expression (0%)." - What is meant by "0%"? Page 11, third paragraph: "Figure 2 shows representative of immunohistochemical staining for AKR1B10 in liver tissues." - This sentence should be improved.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 27286
Title: Pretreatment AKR1B10 expression predicts the risk of HCC development after HCV eradication
Reviewer's code: 00008874
Reviewer's country: Japan
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2016-05-23 11:32
Date reviewed: 2016-05-31 19:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors investigated the association between aldo-keto reductase family 1 member B10 (AKR1B10) expression and hepatocarcinogenesis after hepatitis C virus eradication. They studied 303 chronic hepatitis C patients who had achieved sustained virological response (SVR). This manuscript contains some interesting topics for prediction of HCC development after SVR. However, there are some criticisms to be clarified. Major point 1. In this study, the cut off value of AKR1B10 expression was 8%. However, similar study from this group (J Gastroenterol Hepatol. 2016 Jan 13. doi: 10.1111/jgh.13295. [Epub ahead of print]) took 6% as the cut off value of AKR1B10 expression. Authors should discuss how decided the cut off value of AKR1B10 expression. 2. Page 5, Core Tips. Authors concluded that "Thus, AKR1B10 is not only a novel biomarker for assessing the risk of HCC after SVR: it might also be involved in the very early stages of hepatocarcinogenesis." The results of this study leaded the conclusion "AKR1B10 is not only a novel biomarker for assessing the risk of HCC after SVR." It is true. However, the sentence "it might also be involved in the very early stages of hepatocarcinogenesis" is speculation. This sentence should be removed. 3. This study analyzed

the association between the pretreatment AKR1B10 expression and HCC development after SVR in patients with chronic hepatitis C. How about the association between the post-treatment AKR1B10 expression after SVR and HCC development? I think it is difficult to take liver biopsy samples after treatment. If authors have data, please discuss the AKR1B10 expression before and after IFN treatment.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 27286
Title: Pretreatment AKR1B10 expression predicts the risk of HCC development after HCV eradication
Reviewer's code: 00013203
Reviewer's country: Mexico
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2016-05-23 11:32
Date reviewed: 2016-06-13 23:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present study the authors tried to investigate the association between aldo-keto reductase family 1 member B10 (AKR1B10) expression and hepatocarcinogenesis after hepatitis C virus eradication. Although the results of this study look interesting. The sample size and the incomplete evaluation are the major problems. Also there is a previous publication of this group of researches with similar information. Sato S, Genda T, Ichida T, Murata A, Tsuzura H, Narita Y, Kanemitsu 1, Ishikawa S, Kikuchi T1, Mori M, Hirano K, Iijima K1, Wada 4, Nagahara A, Watanabe S. Impact of aldo-keto reductase family 1 member B10 on the risk of hepatitis C virus-related hepatocellular carcinoma. J Gastroenterol Hepatol. 2016 Jan 13. doi: 10.1111/jgh.13295. Comments: 1. It is important to clarify what information is new in this study compared to the previous one (J Gastroenterol Hepatol. 2016 Jan 13. doi: 10.1111/jgh.13295) 2. The sample size of 8 patients is too small and the results with this methodology is difficult to evaluate. 3. Did you have a chance to use RT-PCR to evaluate de expression of AKR1B10? 4. Those patients who developed HCC had advanced fibrosis that is in part of the reason why they had more altered their liver function tests. What do you

think about that? 5. The advanced liver fibrosis, genotype 1 in my opinion are the most important factors in the development of HCC. Could you please discuss it in the discussion section? 6. I suggest to create one table with the main characteristics of the 8 patients with HCC 7. The discussion is very poor. I suggest to rewrite it. Focus on the main results