

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26758

Title: Circulating tumor DNA as a liquid biopsy target for detection of pancreatic cancer

Reviewer's code: 03478343

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-27 08:30

Date reviewed: 2016-05-01 21:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have attached a word doc with all the minor typos and comments of where to add references. Since you are writing a review for a wide audience it is important to give as much literary support as possible whenever making a claim. Was Figure 1 drawn from scratch or based on someone else's artwork? Please acknowledge or give credit to the artist if it came from other artwork.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26758

Title: Circulating tumor DNA as a liquid biopsy target for detection of pancreatic cancer

Reviewer's code: 03478298

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-27 08:30

Date reviewed: 2016-05-25 21:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review, the authors provide an overview of the current status of blood-based tests for diagnosis of pancreatic cancer and the potential utility of Circulating tumor DNA (ctDNA) for precision medicine. This review discussed an interesting topic. However, in this paper, as far as I can judge, the content that ctDNA as a liquid biopsy target for detection of pancreatic cancer needed further discussing. In addition, This review not expressing their original insights.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26758

Title: Circulating tumor DNA as a liquid biopsy target for detection of pancreatic cancer

Reviewer's code: 03017300

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-27 08:30

Date reviewed: 2016-06-08 10:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

CONTENTS: The concept of "liquid biopsy" using simple peripheral blood sampling and detecting the circulating tumor DNA (ctDNA) has been addressed to provide diagnostic information for pancreatic cancer in this review. The authors provide an overview of the current status of blood-based tests for diagnosis of pancreatic cancer and the potential utility of ctDNA for precision medicine. They also discuss challenges that remain to be addressed in developing practical ctDNA-based liquid biopsy approaches for early diagnosis of pancreatic cancer. However, at present, clinical screening for early detection of PDAC using liquid biopsy has only limited effectiveness, especially for data from the randomized clinical trial, but may be a promising approach. **MAJOR COMMENTS:** 1. The sensitivity and specificity of these currently used tumor biomarkers are not sufficient for clinically effective application in early detection of pancreatic cancer. Despite recent progress in understanding of the disease at the molecular level, no reliable blood-based biomarker for screening of pancreatic cancer has yet become clinically available. However, for clinical considerations, it is much more significant for details of the sensitivity and specificity of ctDNA detection such as KRAS, which should be addressed especially in pancreatic cancer. **MINOR**



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

COMMENTS: In my opinion, a section and a synoptic table regarding new agents targeting circulating tumor DNA as a liquid biopsy target for detection of pancreatic cancer is suggested. It is better to introduce the detailed value of the sensitivity and specificity for detection of PDAC for KRAS detection with or without the combined detection of the serum CA19-9 level, especially for the prognostic significances.