

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28620

Title: Combination of three-gene immunohistochemical panel and magnetic resonance imaging-detected extramural vascular invasion to assess prognosis in non-advanced rectal cancer patients

Reviewer's code: 02998157

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-07 09:59

Date reviewed: 2016-08-01 19:31

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|--|--|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Excellent study. Only some minor spell mistakes should be corrected.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28620

Title: Combination of three-gene immunohistochemical panel and magnetic resonance imaging-detected extramural vascular invasion to assess prognosis in non-advanced rectal cancer patients

Reviewer's code: 03261540

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-07 09:59

Date reviewed: 2016-08-04 11:37

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|--|--|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Excellent study. No comments.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28620

Title: Combination of three-gene immunohistochemical panel and magnetic resonance imaging-detected extramural vascular invasion to assess prognosis in non-advanced rectal cancer patients

Reviewer's code: 02447371

Reviewer's country: France

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-07 09:59

Date reviewed: 2016-08-11 10:06

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an excellent study about the combination of three-gene immunohistochemical panel and MRI-detected extramural vascular invasion to assess prognosis in non-advanced rectal cancer patients. This study included 329 patients with pathologically confirmed rectal cancer who had undergone an MRI without previous treatment. The candidate proteins that were reported to be altered by rectal cancer were examined in tissues by immunohistochemistry. Of the three proteins that were tested, c-MYC, PCNA and TIMP1 were detected with high expression in 35.9%, 23.7% and 58.7% of tumors, respectively. Significant associations were found between the expression of these proteins and the prognosis. Applying these three proteins as an IHC panel could be used to classify patients into different subgroups. The data suggest that the three-protein panel of c-MYC, PCNA and TIMP1 combined with MRI-detected EMVI could provide additional prognostic information for preoperative treatment of rectal cancer. The study is well designed and displayed. 1 There are some minor revisions needed. 2 The discussion should be checked, and some more recent ref can be



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

discussed. 3 Tables and figures are good.